(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 International Criminal Court
- 2 Trial Chamber X
- 3 Situation: Republic of Mali
- 4 In the case of The Prosecutor v. Al Hassan Ag Abdoul Aziz Ag Mohamed Ag
- 5 Mahmoud ICC-01/12-01/18
- 6 Presiding Judge Antoine Kesia-Mbe Mindua, Judge Tomoko Akane and Judge
- 7 Kimberly Prost
- 8 Trial Hearing Courtroom 3
- 9 Wednesday, 15 September 2021
- 10 (The hearing starts in open session at 9.34 a.m.)
- 11 THE COURT USHER: [9:34:10] All rise.
- 12 The International Criminal Court is now in session.
- 13 Please be seated.
- 14 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:34:25](Interpretation) Court is in session.
- 15 Good morning to all.
- 16 Mr Courtroom Officer, could you please call the case.
- 17 THE COURT OFFICER: [9:34:56] Good morning, Mr President, your Honours.
- 18 This is the situation in the Republic of Mali, in the case of The Prosecutor versus Al
- 19 Hassan Ag Abdoul Aziz Ag Mohamed Ag Mahmoud, case reference ICC-01/12-01/18.
- 20 And, for the record, we are in open session.
- 21 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:35:17](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 22 Mr Courtroom Officer.
- 23 As every morning, we are going to check the various teams, starting with the Office of
- 24 the Prosecutor.
- 25 Madam Prosecutor, please.

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 MS LUPING: [9:35:30] Good morning, Mr President. Good morning,
- 2 your Honours. Appearing on behalf of the Prosecution this morning are the same
- 3 team as two days ago. That's myself, Dianne Luping; Mr Gilles Dutertre; and Ms
- 4 Yayoi Yamaguchi.
- 5 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:35:50](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 6 Madam Prosecutor.
- 7 Now I shall turn to the Defence.
- 8 MS TAYLOR: [9:35:56] Good morning, Mr President. Good morning,
- 9 your Honours. Good morning to everyone in the courtroom and around the
- 10 courtroom.
- 11 The Defence for Mr Al Hassan is represented today by Mr Julia Basile; Ms Dolly
- 12 Chahla; and myself, Melinda Taylor.
- 13 Thank you very much.
- 14 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:36:14](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 15 Ms Taylor.
- 16 I'm now turning to the Legal Representatives of Victims. Maître.
- 17 MR KASSONGO: [9:36:21](Interpretation) Good morning, Mr President.
- 18 Thank you.
- 19 Good morning, your Honours. Good morning to all.
- 20 The Legal Representatives of Victims, as a team, is in the very simplified form this
- 21 morning. I am myself, Maître Kassongo, who is representing the legal -- the victims.
- 22 And I thank you very much.
- 23 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:36:42](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 24 Maître Kassongo.
- 25 This morning, we shall be continuing with the testimony of Witness P-0654 for the

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 Prosecution.
- 2 Before addressing the witness, I would like to remind you -- or, in fact, point out for
- 3 the record, that yesterday, the Chamber did not sit and the hearing was cancelled at
- 4 the behest of the Defence for matters relating to the accused.
- 5 This morning, at the request of the Defence, once again, the Chamber has granted
- 6 authorisation to the accused to follow the proceedings via video link from the
- 7 detention unit.
- 8 There we are.
- 9 Good morning, Mr Witness. How are you?
- 10 WITNESS: MLI-OTP-P-0654 (On former oath)
- 11 (The witness speaks French)
- 12 (The witness gives evidence via video link)
- 13 THE WITNESS: [9:37:46](Interpretation) Good morning, Mr President. I am well.
- 14 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:37:52](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 15 Mr Witness.
- 16 THE WITNESS: [9:37:56](Interpretation) Thank you.
- 17 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:37:57](Interpretation) I would like to, on behalf of
- 18 the Chamber, wish you -- welcome you once again and remind you that you are still
- 19 under oath and that you should speak the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the
- 20 truth.
- 21 I would like to lastly remind you of my practical advice with regard to addressing the
- 22 Court. We must all speak in this courtroom slowly and clearly, respecting the
- 23 habitual pauses for the work of the interpreters and court reporters to be conducted
- 24 smoothly.
- 25 So this morning, we shall continue with the cross-examination on the part of the

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 Defence.
- 2 And, without further ado, I shall now be handing over to Ms Taylor.
- 3 Ms Taylor.
- 4 MS TAYLOR: [9:38:58] Thank you.
- 5 QUESTIONED BY MS TAYLOR (Continuing)
- 6 Q. [9:39:00] Good morning, Mr Witness. How are you this morning?
- 7 A. [9:39:06] Good morning. I am well, Counsel.
- 8 Q. [9:39:10] Mr Witness, during the courtesy meeting, I explained to you that you'd
- 9 be able to see perhaps Mr Al Hassan behind me. But as the Presiding Judge has
- 10 explained, Mr Al Hassan has regrettably had back pain, and the Chamber has kindly
- allowed him to participate via video link. So we can see a screen of him in the
- 12 courtroom.
- 13 It's my understanding that he can see you, but you might not be able to see him. But
- I want to assure you, that is out of no disrespect to the Chamber or to you that he is
- 15 not present today in the courtroom.
- 16 A. [9:39:46] Okay. Thank you.
- 17 MS TAYLOR: [9:39:48] Mr President, just a quick housekeeping matter. If
- 18 Mr Al Hassan has any issues, is it acceptable to the Chamber if he raises his hand so
- 19 as not to disturb the proceedings? Because he can't communicate directly with the
- 20 Defence.
- 21 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:40:05](Interpretation) Yes, indeed, Ms Taylor.
- 22 Indeed.
- 23 MS TAYLOR:
- 24 Q. [9:40:08] Now, Mr Witness, if you may recall during the last hearing, we were
- 25 discussing a particular document. I'm going to ask for that document to be shown

ICC-01/12-01/18

- on your screen and I want to reassure you that it's not going to be shown to the public.
- 2 So just because you see something on your screen, does not -- does not mean that the
- 3 public gallery can see it.
- 4 Now, the document in question is Defence tab 209. It's MLI-D28-0005-7194.
- 5 And if the court officer could kindly put it on evidence 1.
- 6 On Monday I read out the contents of this document, so I won't repeat it. It refers to
- 7 youths coming to protest.
- 8 The youths referred to in this document, did they come from Timbuktu, to your
- 9 knowledge?
- 10 A. [9:41:23] Yes, these young people are from Timbuktu, more specifically, from
- 11 Hamma Bangou and Sareïkena.
- 12 Q. [9:41:42] And this document refers to destruction and fires. Were the youths
- 13 responsible for this?
- 14 A. [9:41:50] I can confirm that the young people were, indeed, responsible for these
- acts because at a given moment in time, we thought that the youth had been
- infiltrated by extremists who did not want alcohol to be sold, and there is a group of
- 17 young people that set itselves up as gendarmes to fight against this practice of the sale
- 18 of alcohol.
- 19 And the president of this group came to see me in person to say that he was going to
- 20 conduct a campaign to raise awareness about the sale of drugs in the town of
- 21 Timbuktu, but he never said that they were going to take part in any destruction or
- 22 that they would themselves administer justice.
- 23 So, on the day of this event, I called him and he said that they had been taken over by
- 24 young people who really wanted to destroy these areas.
- 25 So I understood that it was not an invisible hand if you like; that it was young people

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 from Timbuktu who did conduct this act. I can confirm that, yes.
- 2 Q. [9:43:46] And what are the buildings we can see in these photos?
- 3 A. [9:43:52] This is what we call a nightclub for young people. When I say
- 4 "a nightclub", it is a dancing bar or café; so it is a place where young people would
- 5 come together.
- 6 Q. [9:44:30] At transcript 132, realtime, page 62 to 63, lines 22 to 26, you stated:
- 7 As I said earlier, of all the various occupations, Timbuktu was able to learn some
- 8 lessons. The one of 2012 was a reminder that women should not wear indecent
- 9 clothing, and the attitude of young people influenced by new technologies was such
- 10 that people had even spoken out against that attitude. The proof of that was there
- was the establishment of a commission for the establishment of values and morality
- 12 of Timbuktu.
- 13 And you refer to a certain person being a spokesperson, but I'm not going to name
- 14 that person.
- Now, Mr Witness, speaking of the time period before 2012, do you recall an assembly
- 16 pour la correction des moeurs taking place in Timbuktu in June 2010?
- 17 A. [9:45:48] I remember only too well because I took part. It was at Sankoré
- 18 square.
- 19 Q. [9:45:59] I'm going to ask the Registry to bring up a document and for it not to
- 20 be shown publicly out of an abundance of caution. It's Defence tab 143. It's
- 21 MLI-D28-0004-3227. If it could be shown on evidence 1, and, just to emphasise again
- that we are in public session.
- 23 Mr Witness, do you recognise any person in this photograph?
- 24 A. [9:46:49] (Redacted)
- 25 MS TAYLOR: [9:47:03] Mr President, I believe it might be best to quickly go into

(Private Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 private session.
- 2 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:47:12](Interpretation) Mr Courtroom Officer,
- 3 private session, please.
- 4 (Private session at 9.47 a.m.)
- 5 THE COURT OFFICER: [9:47:17] We're in private session, Mr President.
- 6 (Redacted)
- 7 (Redacted)
- 8 (Redacted)
- 9 (Redacted)
- 10 (Redacted)
- 11 (Redacted)
- 12 (Redacted)
- 13 (Redacted)
- 14 (Redacted)
- 15 (Redacted)
- 16 (Redacted)
- 17 (Redacted)
- 18 (Redacted)
- 19 (Redacted)
- 20 (Redacted)
- 21 (Redacted)
- 22 (Redacted)
- 23 (Redacted)
- 24 (Redacted)
- 25 (Redacted)

ICC-01/12-01/18 Trial Hearing (Private Session) MLI-OTP-P-0654 1 (Redacted) 2 (Redacted) 3 (Redacted) 4 (Redacted) 5 (Redacted) 6 (Redacted) 7 (Redacted) 8 (Redacted) 9 (Redacted) 10 (Redacted) 11 (Redacted) 12 (Redacted) 13 (Redacted)

- 14 (Redacted)
- 15 (Redacted)
- 16 (Open session at 9.50 a.m.)
- 17 THE COURT OFFICER: [9:50:23] We are back in open session, Mr President.
- 18 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:50:30](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 19 Mr Courtroom Officer.
- Ms Taylor. 20
- MS TAYLOR: 21
- [9:50:37] I'm going to bring up another document. It's Defence tab 140, and it 22 Q.
- 23 should not be shown to the public. It's MLI-D28-0004-3189.
- 24 The description states that these are historical photos from the Assemblée des Moeurs at
- 25 the place Sankoré.

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 Is this the same event that we were discussing?
- 2 A. [9:51:21] Well, I do think that that's the same event. It was the same gathering.
- 3 It's the same event.
- 4 Q. [9:51:44] Now, Mr Witness, without giving any names, the photos here have
- 5 several persons.
- 6 Are these people coming from the local population of Timbuktu?
- 7 A. [9:52:01] Yes. You have all the high leaders, the notables of Timbuktu: The
- 8 religious leaders, the traditional leaders, the customary leaders and even the ...
- 9 THE INTERPRETER: [9:52:34] Inaudible.
- 10 MS TAYLOR: [9:52:36]
- 11 Q. [9:52:38] Mr Witness, I believe in both the French and the English transcript,
- 12 they didn't catch the last thing you said. You said -- you referred to the traditional
- 13 authorities and "even the ..."
- 14 What were your last words?
- 15 A. [9:52:53] The griot, that is, the caste men, men of caste.
- 16 Q. [9:53:04] Now according to this post, the assembly issued resolutions to the
- 17 mayor. And the resolutions were issued by the imam of the Djinguereber mosque.
- 18 That's Imam Essayouti.
- 19 Do you recall these resolutions?
- 20 A. [9:53:24] Yes, I do remember some of those resolutions. It's 11 years ago now.
- 21 So amongst those resolutions, there was the -- the fact that the election for Miss -- the
- 22 "Miss" election should not be held in Timbuktu, and there was also the formal
- 23 prohibition of -- for selling alcohol in the medina it was prohibited to sell alcohol in
- 24 the medina and the fact that it was unacceptable for girls to wear indecent attire in
- 25 the medina.

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 Well, so those were some of the resolutions, but I knew that those would come to
- 2 mind. I would memorise them.
- 3 THE INTERPRETER: [9:54:52] The election of the "Miss" would be the beauty
- 4 contest, message from the interpreter.
- 5 MS TAYLOR: [9:54:59] I'm just going to bring up another document. It's Defence
- 6 tab 147, MLI-D28-0004-3335. This is a document titled: "RESOLUTIONS COMITE
- 7 DES MOEURS 10 juin 2010 Tombouctou".
- 8 And then we have: "ASSEMBLÉE GÉNÉRALE" --
- 9 (Interpretation) Resolutions of the *Comite des Moeurs* of 10th June 2010 in Timbuktu.
- 10 Assembly general on Saturday 12 June 2010 at Place Sankoré. General resolutions.
- 11 (Speaks English) Do you have this document in front of you, Mr Witness?
- 12 A. [9:55:52] Yes, I do have it up on the screen.
- 13 Q. [9:55:57] And does this refresh your memory -- does this appear to be the
- 14 resolutions that were issued at that assembly? We can scroll through if it's easier for
- 15 you to read through it.
- 16 A. [9:56:11] Yes, that is indeed the heading, I remember.
- 17 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:56:39](Interpretation) Madam Prosecutor, please.
- 18 MS LUPING: [9:56:41] Mr President, your Honours, it's just a question of procedure.
- 19 We just want to ensure that the witness has sufficient time to properly read through
- 20 this document. I know that the witness does usually require a hard copy to be able
- 21 to read it in front of him -- to be able to read it properly, and it usually does take a bit
- 22 more time to be able to read through documents thoroughly. It's just a request that
- 23 more time be given if he's being asked to confirm the authenticity of this document.
- 24 And I would also just note that this is dated -- we have a date here that is three years
- 25 after the purported date of the document.

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 So it's just to ensure enough time is given to the witness to read it.
- 2 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:57:32](Interpretation) Madam Prosecutor, are you
- 3 saying that the document is dated three years later? I see Timbuktu, the 12th of June
- 4 2010.
- 5 THE WITNESS: [9:57:51](Interpretation) Yes. In fact, the assembly was held on the
- 6 10th. And on the 12th, there was a publication of the resolutions.
- 7 THE INTERPRETER: [9:58:02] Says the witness.
- 8 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:58:04](Interpretation) Very well. But, Madam
- 9 Prosecutor, before I hand over to the Defence --
- 10 MS LUPING: [9:58:09] Mr President, if you look under the heading at the very top,
- there's a name that I'm not going to state. You will see a date, 25 December 2013.
- 12 That is the date I'm referring to. So my -- my point is this, to make sure, in fairness
- 13 to the witness, that he's given proper time to read through this document. It's clearly
- 14 not from him as well. So it's just an opportunity to be -- to be given. That's my -- it
- was a simple point. Just that he been given sufficient time to read the document.
- And, I understand a hard-copy binder is being provided, but when it's being scrolled
- through, it's just being scrolled through extremely quickly.
- 18 That -- that was my only point. And -- but I did want to note, to bring to
- 19 your Honours' attention, there is a difference in the dates that you need to be aware
- 20 of.
- 21 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [9:59:02](Interpretation) Very well, Madam
- 22 Prosecutor. At the top of the document, we can indeed see the date of the -- of 2013,
- 23 25 December 2013.
- 24 Ms Taylor, Madam Prosecutor is just reminding us of our procedure; namely, that the
- 25 witness needs to have enough time to read through the document.

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 MS TAYLOR: [9:59:25] Thank you, Mr President.
- 2 The Prosecution may recall that this document has already been submitted through
- 3 other witnesses. So I think this was an unnecessary intervention. I also intend to
- 4 read out components of the document before putting questions to this witness. I'm
- 5 happy for him to read it in its entirety, but I hadn't even put a question to the witness
- 6 when the Prosecution objected.
- 7 So we would ask them to exercise a little bit of restraint.
- 8 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:00:07](Interpretation) Very well, Ms Taylor.
- 9 But let's allow the witness to read the document.
- 10 MS TAYLOR: [10:00:11] Certainly.
- 11 Q. [10:00:12] Mr Witness, do you have up -- I'm not sure if the court officer on site
- has been able to print documents for you. If so, it would be wonderful if a copy
- could be provided to you. If not, if the Registry could slowly scroll down. But I can
- also read out components into the record, but perhaps if you can look through it first.
- 15 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:01:06](Interpretation) Mr Witness, are you
- 16 ready?
- 17 THE WITNESS: [10:01:07](Interpretation) Yes.
- 18 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:01:11](Interpretation) Ms Taylor.
- 19 MS TAYLOR: [10:01:13]
- 20 Q. [10:01:13] Thank you.
- 21 Mr Witness, I'm going to ask a preliminary question.
- 22 Are you aware of an organisation called the UJMM? The *Union des Jeunes Musulmans*
- 23 du Mali.
- 24 A. [10:01:28] Yes. I know that organisation. It is a religious organisation.
- Q. [10:01:36] And was it connected to this initiative, this initiative of the *Comité des*

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 moeurs?
- 2 A. [10:01:51] The name is UJMM actually, Union of Young Muslims of Mali. So
- 3 the association was a member of the morality committee.
- 4 Q. [10:02:15] Do you remember how many members this association had?
- 5 A. [10:02:20] It would be difficult to tell you the number of people who are
- 6 members of an organisation or an association, but I do know that this association does
- 7 have an office, and a number of pious people are the ones who are the leaders of this
- 8 association.
- 9 Q. [10:02:56] You've referred to "a number of pious people" who are the leaders of
- 10 the association.
- 11 Are you able to give us the names of these people?
- 12 A. [10:03:05] Yes. I don't know the first names of some of them -- or, at least, not
- off the top of my head. But there's -- well, most are *médersa* teachers. So Bollo
- 14 Albakaye. There's Haidara, a fellow by the name of Haidara, as well there's Sidi
- 15 (phon) Moulaye, and another by the name of Shabuli (phon) or something sort of like
- 16 that.
- Well, those are the most influential ones that one finds in the city. So those are the
- names, but the first names I -- I can't remember, or I don't know for now.
- 19 Q. [10:04:43] If I could just bring up Defence tab 220. That's MLI-D28-0005-7222.
- 20 And, Mr Witness, again could you be given a hard copy on site? If the Registry
- 21 could confirm whether that's possible. Mr Witness, I understand that a hard copy has
- been given to you as well.
- 23 A. [10:05:41] Yes. I'm -- I'm just looking for it.
- Q. [10:05:47] It's tab 220, if that assists the field office.
- 25 A. [10:06:15] Yes, I found it.

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 Q. [10:06:19] Mr Witness, if you could look through it and if you could indicate to
- 2 me when you've had a chance to look through it and then I'll pose some questions.
- 3 A. [10:07:52] Yes, I've skimmed it.
- 4 Q. [10:07:56] Mr Witness, this is a document published by the *Union des Jeunes*
- 5 Musulmans du Mali Tomboctou in June 2010. Is this the same organisation we were
- 6 just discussing?
- 7 A. [10:08:14] Exactly, the same association.
- 8 Q. [10:08:19] Now this document refers to a general assembly on 12 June 2010, and
- 9 it refers to resolutions having been issued. Are these the same resolutions we were
- 10 just referring to?
- 11 A. [10:08:37] Yes, the resolutions that I just saw, they're the same as the ones that
- were provided to the authorities.
- 13 Q. [10:09:02] Mr Witness, at this point in time, was there a concern regarding the
- 14 clothing behaviour of young girls and boys and that it would compromise the cultural
- 15 heritage of Timbuktu?
- 16 A. [10:09:15] Yes, in actual fact, the alert had been -- or the alarm bell had been
- sounded ever since 2009 by a number of wise men in Timbuktu who deplored what
- 18 was going on in the city, particularly in the medina, in recent years.
- 19 And in 2009, even then, Timbuktu was coveted because many tourists would come,
- 20 and, to draw attention of visitors, Timbuktu had to remain authentic, including
- 21 people's clothing, the way the people behaved.
- 22 So some remarks were made during this time when the alarm bells went off, so to
- 23 speak, in 2010. After a dialogue and consultation with all neighbourhoods of the city,
- 24 the wise men gathered, in addition to a number of associations, including UJMMA,
- 25 U-J-M-M ... and RECOTRADE, which was another association that brought together

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- all the men from the various castes of Timbuktu. RECOTRADE.
- 2 Both -- well, you see, the morality committee was made up of various people and I
- 3 would say it was represented -- well, if you were a imam or a marabout, or if you
- 4 weren't a neighbourhood leader, you belonged to a cultural association. So all the
- 5 people of Timbuktu were represented within the morality committee in order to do
- 6 something about this -- this downward slide, so to speak, in morality that had been
- 7 observed.
- 8 Indeed, people had noticed that -- I mentioned the influence of new technologies,
- 9 television, soap operas series from the west. All of these things seriously affected the
- 10 behaviour of young people.
- And so, you see, often, we would see young girls wearing indecent clothing and
- 12 what I mean by that, miniskirts, transparent items of clothing, provocative
- 13 clothing not the kind of clothing that is indicative of this city of culture and religion,
- 14 namely, Timbuktu.
- 15 Q. [10:13:13] Mr Witness, you referred to an organisation called "RECOTRADE."
- 16 Could you please spell that so that we have it accurately reflected in the transcript?
- 17 A. [10:13:33] R-I-C-O-T-R-A-D-E (sic).
- 18 THE INTERPRETER: [10:13:50] "E" -- RECOTRADE.
- 19 THE WITNESS: [10:13:51](Interpretation) I can tell you what it means. It is the
- 20 network for traditional communicators for development.
- 21 THE INTERPRETER: [10:14:05] RECOTRADE.
- 22 MS TAYLOR:
- 23 Q. [10:14:11] Does this organisation have a governing body or leadership?
- 24 A. [10:14:16] Yes. Yes, it did have sort of a -- I guess, you could call it a steering
- committee, and this committee was in all the communes, in all the neighbourhoods

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 and all regions of Mali.
- 2 Q. [10:14:48] Do you recall who was involved in the leadership in the years leading
- 3 up to 2012?
- 4 A. [10:14:55] Up until 2012, it was Moussa Moussa Ag Mohamed Ali.
- 5 Q. [10:15:21] And what was his profession?
- 6 A. [10:15:25] He was a smith, an ironsmith.
- 7 Q. [10:15:35] I'd like to turn to page 2773 of this document, Mr Witness, if you have
- 8 that in front of you.
- 9 And if it could also be shown on evidence 1. I apologise, no, 7224. It's the
- 10 recommendations. This document sets out a series of recommend --
- 11 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:16:04](Interpretation) Ms Prosecutor.
- 12 MS LUPING: [10:16:07] Mr President, your Honours, this is now the third document
- that the witness has been shown, and I've tried not to interrupt, but before there is
- 14 any further questions regarding the actual content of this document, the Prosecution
- 15 would simply ask that the normal questions be asked as to: Has the witness actually
- seen the document before? Does the witness know who has authored this document?
- 17 Certainly, the last document the witness was asked if it was, in fact, the resolution
- that he'd been referring to.
- 19 Now before these types of questions are put, in particular, delving into the content,
- 20 we would simply ask that the procedure be adopted as normal, that, basically, as per
- 21 the conduct of proceedings decision.
- 22 The witness also be asked questions regarding his knowledge as to the nature of this
- 23 document, whether he's even actually even seen it before.
- 24 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:17:08](Interpretation) Ms Taylor.
- 25 MS TAYLOR: [10:17:10] Thank you, Mr President. That's not actually what the

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- decision on the conduct of the proceedings states. It's sufficient to establish that the
- 2 witness has knowledge of the events or issues being discussed in the document.
- 3 This witness has established multiple times that he's aware of the information set out
- 4 in this document. He's ascertained that it's the same resolution he's been referring
- 5 to.
- 6 And again, I'm in open session here, but this is a witness who has already given
- 7 testimony as to a general assembly, to resolutions being issued during that general
- 8 assembly, his knowledge of those resolutions. He has now read the resolutions in
- 9 both sets of documents and stated it's the same resolutions that are being referred to.
- 10 Now I'm entitled to put questions to this witness in relation to the contents of this
- 11 document. It's not necessary to establish that he's read this specific document.
- 12 There's nothing in the decision on the conduct of proceedings that states that, and, the
- 13 Prosecution is aware of that because they repeatedly show videos and articles to
- 14 witnesses who have not authored the document and who have not reviewed or read
- 15 the document.
- 16 I do hope we can move forward to save time.
- 17 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:18:39](Interpretation) One last time, Ms
- 18 (Overlapping speakers)
- 19 THE INTERPRETER: Overlapping.
- 20 MS LUPING: [10:18:44] (Overlapping speakers) Your Honours, very briefly, the
- 21 Prosecution is not objecting to the use of the document with this witness, and that is
- 22 not the point, and I'm sure Defence counsel is fully aware of that.
- 23 The point we're making is simply at the end of this trial, when your Honours are
- 24 turning to determine whether or not an item of evidence is appropriately admitted
- 25 through a specific witness or not, there will be certain questions that will need to be

ICC-01/12-01/18

- asked and the basic questions include, simply, whether or not the witness has actually
- 2 ever seen this document or not, aware of its existence, aware when it was made.
- 3 That is all I'm simply -- the point I'm making.
- 4 And I would just note for the record that when Defence counsel refers to this witness
- 5 as having confirmed that the resolution that was shown to him was, in fact, the
- 6 resolution, there was -- he hadn't even finished reading the document. It was
- 7 removed from his screen before being able to confirm it.
- 8 And that was the point I was making earlier as well. He needs time to read
- 9 documents if he's being asked to confirm it is what it purports to be. Thank you.
- 10 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:19:58](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 11 Madam Prosecutor.
- 12 Ms Taylor, I don't see the problem in what the Prosecution has said. We've already
- said that the foundation would be something like, you would ask the witness if he
- 14 wrote the document, if he was familiar with the document or if he was familiar with
- 15 the events relating to the document.
- In this case, he said he was aware of the facts. But you do need to give the witness
- 17 enough time to read the actual document. I believe the Prosecutor is correct when
- she makes this point. So give the witness enough time to read the document before
- 19 putting questions to him.
- 20 MS TAYLOR: [10:20:48] Mr President, with the greatest respect, that is exactly what
- 21 I was doing when the Prosecutor objected. If you actually scroll through to the
- 22 transcript, I had not put a question to the witness. I had asked the Registry to go to
- 23 this specific page to allow the witness to read through it. I've also on multiple
- occasion asked if this witness has the hard copy with him. So I was doing exactly
- 25 that. And I would ask the Prosecution to recall that this -- these resolutions have

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 been discussed with other witnesses.
- 2 Now, I know that Ms Luping was not in the courtroom at that point in time, but I
- don't believe it's appropriate to apply a standard that does not arise from the decision
- 4 on the conduct of proceedings. And we would like to avoid multiple interventions,
- 5 which are premature and which prevent us from using our time in an efficient
- 6 manner.
- 7 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:21:58](Interpretation) Ms Prosecutor --
- 8 MS LUPING: [10:21:58](Overlapping speakers) Just one brief point --
- 9 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:21:56](Interpretation) -- I've dealt with the
- 10 problem. What's going on?
- 11 MS LUPING: [10:22:02](Overlapping speakers) Mr President, your Honours, it's
- 12 completely irrelevant whether or not other witnesses have seen documents being
- 13 shown to this witness. If he's being asked, Is this document I'm referring now to
- 14 the prior resolution what it purports to be, he needs to be given an opportunity to
- read it before he can say whether he agrees with that proposition. It's neither here
- 16 nor there if others have also read it before. That's not our point, Mr President, and
- 17 that was all I have to say. Thank you.
- 18 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:22:35](Interpretation) Very well. I think we
- 19 have dealt with -- finished this discussion. I think what's good is that, while we
- were having this discussion, the witness was in a position to read the document.
- 21 Mr Witness, did you read the document?
- 22 THE WITNESS: [10:22:52](Interpretation) Yes.
- 23 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:22:54](Interpretation) Counsel.
- 24 MS TAYLOR: [10:22:56]
- 25 Q. [10:22:57] Wonderful, Mr Witness. Have you had a chance to read all the

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 recommendations? Otherwise, I'm happy to read them into the record.
- 2 A. [10:23:07] No, I've read it all while you were having your discussion.
- 3 Q. [10:23:13] Thank you very much, Mr Witness, and thank you for your patience.
- 4 Mr Witness, is it correct that before 2012, within the local population of Timbuktu,
- 5 there were groups that were advocating for a *Comité des moeurs* to be set up in each
- 6 quarter of Timbuktu?
- 7 A. [10:23:36] Yes, indeed.
- 8 Q. [10:23:48] And is it also correct that before 2012, within the local population of
- 9 Timbuktu, there was support for measures to be taken during the Friday prayer to
- 10 restrict circulation in the city during this time?
- 11 A. [10:24:12] Yes, that was amongst the recommendations from the general
- 12 assembly that we see here.
- Q. [10:24:22] And is it correct before 2012, within the local population of Timbuktu,
- 14 there was support for measures to be taken so that Ramadan would be strictly
- 15 observed?
- 16 A. [10:24:38] Yes, for the specific case of Ramadan and Maouloud, because you
- 17 have to take into account both celebrations. During Ramadan, people didn't want
- activities to occur that would be a distraction, so all other activities had to be brought
- 19 to a halt during Ramadan. Even closing the bars and other establishments had been
- 20 discussed during the assembly.
- 21 And as for Maouloud, it was necessary to avoid because the afternoon of the
- 22 baptism -- that is, an occasion for people to come together. Men and women were
- 23 gathering together at the same time, mixing in the same place even though wisdom
- 24 would have it that women would be on one side and men would be on the other
- 25 side so as to praise the prophet, the reason for the gathering.

ICC-01/12-01/18

- Because, you see, this event was a celebration of the prophet's birth and baptism. So
- 2 strong recommendations were made in this regard in 2010.
- 3 Q. [10:26:32] And before 2012, was there also support within the local population
- 4 for uniforms to be worn in school?
- 5 A. [10:26:46] Yes. School clothing is what we called the uniforms. By that, we
- 6 meant this could keep young students, male or female, to -- it would keep them from
- 7 wearing indecent clothing because, you see, clothing -- uniforms or standard clothing
- 8 would mean that all the children would be the same. There would be no distinctions
- 9 based on what the parents were. The children -- you see, some children did not
- 10 want to ... school because they were ashamed of having to wear the same shirt every
- day, and if the parents did not have the resources to pay for a second shirt, that could
- 12 represent an obstacle to education.
- 13 And the third item for school clothing was that it would allow everyone to be wearing
- 14 the same clothing, same price, same fabric, so there would be equality. It would be
- 15 a physical demonstration of equality.
- 16 That is why the morality committee focused on the wearing of school uniforms.
- 17 Q. [10:28:37] I'd like to bring up Defence tab 144. This is MLI-D28-0004-3228, and
- if that could be put on evidence 1.
- 19 If it could be scrolled down so the witness can see it, the photo -- the first photo at the
- 20 top.
- Now, Mr Witness, in this photo we can see an individual speaking into a microphone.
- 22 Do you recognise this individual?
- 23 A. [10:29:35] Yes.
- 24 Q. [10:29:42] What is his name?
- 25 A. [10:29:45] Sane Chirfi Alpha.

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 Q. [10:29:54] In these photos, can you see an individual called Mahamane Askia?
- 2 A. [10:30:06] He's not in this photograph. Not in this photograph.
- 3 Q. [10:30:21] Was Mahamane Askia a member of the *comité des moeurs*, to your
- 4 recollection?
- 5 A. [10:30:30] Yes, he was a member of the committee and he was in the commission
- 6 for communication.
- 7 Q. [10:30:46] I'd just like to bring up another document. It's Defence tab 221, it's
- 8 MLI-D28-0005-7226.
- 9 It's a post from 30 June 2010 from the *Union des Jeunes Musulmans du Mali Tomboctou*,
- and the post is titled:
- 11 "The UJMMA Tombouctou (Interpretation) solicits all goodwill from those who could
- 12 help them to find an Islamic radio for Timbuktu."
- 13 (Speaks English) Now, Mr Witness, do you recall if, in 2010, there was an initiative to
- 14 set up an Islamic radio in Timbuktu?
- 15 A. [10:31:58] Yes, this was one of the ambitions of the UJMMA, I do remember that.
- But I didn't know that they had sent out an SOS for this radio to be set up.
- 17 Q. [10:32:24] Do you recall who was involved with this initiative?
- 18 A. [10:32:29] Well, I did give the names of a few influential leaders with whom I
- 19 had discussions. (Redacted)
- 20 (Redacted). So, I do not recall that they had any difficulties in setting up
- 21 a radio or that they had sent out a message for people to show their goodwill and
- 22 provide assistance. I didn't recall that.
- 23 THE INTERPRETER: [10:33:32] Message from the interpreter: Could the witness
- 24 please be requested to speak up. He is mumbling.
- 25 MS TAYLOR: [10:33:42]

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 Q. [10:33:43] Mr Witness, I apologise, the interpreters have asked if you could
- 2 speak with a bit more volume so that they can pick up your voice, if that's okay, given
- 3 there's a significant distance here between you and them.
- 4 Mr Witness, was Mahamane Askia, to your knowledge, involved with this initiative
- 5 of setting up an Islamic radio in Timbuktu?
- 6 A. [10:34:06] I never had a discussion with Mahamane Askia on that subject, so I
- 7 cannot confirm that.
- 8 I said, furthermore, that (Redacted)
- 9 (Redacted). There we
- 10 are.
- 11 Q. [10:34:56] And did they tell you what they intended to broadcast on this radio?
- 12 A. [10:35:04] No. We didn't talk about all of that. As I said, we just talked about
- 13 the procedure for setting up a radio.
- 14 Q. [10:35:23] Now speaking still of the activities of the UJMMA, I'd like to bring up
- 15 Defence tab 219. It's MLI-D28-0005-7220.
- 16 If it could be -- it's tab 219, if that could be provided to the witness and if it could also
- 17 be shown on evidence 1.
- 18 This is a -- and if you could scroll -- this is a report of the activities of the
- 19 UM -- UJM -- A -- MA between 2008 and 2009. And if we scroll down, this
- 20 document refers to a --
- 21 (Interpretation) "A conference on the dress code for young girls."
- 22 (Speaks English) And it states:
- 23 (Interpretation) "On the occasion of the night of the 27 Rajab ..."
- 24 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:36:41](Interpretation) Madam Prosecutor.
- 25 MS LUPING: [10:36:42](Overlapping speakers) Mr President, we just want to note

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- that in spite of your reminder to Defence counsel that it would be appropriate to ask
- 2 the witness if he recognises the author or the document itself, none of these questions
- 3 have been put to the witness in the series of documents we've been shown.
- 4 The last document, the document before that, Defence counsel stated she hadn't got to
- 5 that question. We never got it. We haven't had it for this last document and now
- 6 we're moving on to a new document.
- We would just note for the record, Mr President, that we would be expecting these
- 8 types of questions to be asked for these documents as we have no doubt that
- 9 these -- there will be a request for an ultimate admission of these documents, but we
- 10 haven't had any of that put to this witness.
- 11 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:37:33](Interpretation) Ms Taylor, I am in
- 12 agreement with Madam Prosecutor. Please put the usual questions and do allow the
- witness the time to familiarise himself with the document, please.
- 14 MS TAYLOR: [10:37:47] Thank you, Mr President. And I would like to recall that
- 15 the Chamber's last direction to the Defence was to allow the witness to read the
- 16 recommendations.
- 17 Now, what the Prosecutor is proposing here is a procedure that falls outside the scope
- of the decision on the conduct of the proceedings.
- 19 If I may, Mr President -- I can read it out to the record so that the witness can hear it.
- 20 Now, we can either allow the witness to read it or I can read it. I don't believe that
- 21 we should be prevented from reading the relevant section and then putting the
- 22 question to the witness if he has knowledge --
- 23 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:38:26](No interpretation) (Overlapping
- 24 speakers)
- 25 MS TAYLOR: [10:38:26] -- of the event.

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:38:27](Interpretation) No, no, Ms Taylor.
- 2 Please allow the witness the time to familiarise himself with the document and then
- 3 let us solve this issue once and for all.
- 4 MS TAYLOR: [10:38:38] Thank you, Mr President.
- 5 Q. [10:38:40] Now, Mr Witness, can you again see that at the top of this document,
- 6 the organisation, Union des Jeunes Musulmans du Mali Tombouctou. And if you could
- 7 kindly tell us if that's the same organisation that we've been speaking about for the
- 8 last hour?
- 9 A. [10:39:00] Yes, it is the same organisation.
- 10 Q. [10:39:08] Thank you, Mr Witness.
- 11 Now, if you could kindly read the paragraph stated: (Interpretation) "Conference on
- the dress code for young girls."
- 13 (Speaks English) And if you could kindly alert me when you have read it.
- 14 A. [10:39:58] Yes, I have read it.
- 15 Q. [10:40:01] Now, Mr Witness, my first question is that this refers to -- gives
- several names. It refers to a conference. It says:
- 17 (Interpretation) "A number of communications were presented on the theme of the
- day by: Hammou Mohamed Dedeou, Tadjir Wangara, Bilal Baba, Moussa
- 19 el-Maouloud, Bollo Albakaye and Moulaye Ismaïl."
- 20 (Overlapping speakers)(Speaks English) Do you recognise any of these names?
- 21 A. [10:40:39] Yes, I had provided some of those names, such as, Bollo Albakaye,
- 22 Moulaye Ismaïl. These are marabous and disciples whose names were provided, but
- 23 the first two names are not. Hammou Mohamed Dedeou is an erudite from
- 24 Timbuktu and a preacher. So maybe with regard to the topic of the conference, he
- 25 was called to attend. Then, Tadjir Wangara also. But the others are young people

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 and might be activists for UJMMA.
- 2 Q. [10:41:54] The individuals I have referred to, did they come from Timbuktu to
- 3 your knowledge?
- 4 A. [10:42:02] They all hail from Timbuktu.
- 5 Q. [10:42:12] Do you recall this conference?
- 6 A. [10:42:26] Well, I don't remember it today because a conference and a preaching
- 7 session need -- well, you need to make a distinction. I have taken part in preaching
- 8 sessions with various topics, but if this is a conference, I -- I don't know. A
- 9 conference, to my understanding, I don't remember it as such. But preaching
- 10 sessions, yes.
- 11 Q. [10:43:22] Do you recall -- you've referred to "preaching sessions", and this
- 12 section refers to the associations féminines de la place.
- 13 Do you recall who these preaching sessions were addressed to?
- 14 A. [10:43:37] Well, I know Hammou Mohamed Dedeou, the imminent preacher, at
- 15 the approach of Ramadan, would organise preaching sessions that are very targeted
- in nature. And these teaching -- preaching sessions were aimed at the youth as to
- 17 the behaviour they were to adopt during the period of Ramadan. And there were
- preaching sessions aimed uniquely at women during the month of Ramadan and so
- 19 on and so forth. So every stratum of society had its awareness raised during that
- 20 period. And this was the opportunity for him to also remind what was -- people of
- 21 what was forbidden under religion and the beneficial acts that can be done as
- 22 a recompense.
- 23 So that was what he was in the habit of organising.
- Now, whether that was with the UJMMA or not, I cannot tell you, but I know that
- 25 generally speaking he would order -- organise preaching sessions in Timbuktu.

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 Q. [10:45:18] Now, this individual, Hammou Mohamed Dedeou and you've
- 2 referred to him as an "imminent preacher" was he associated with a particular
- 3 mosque or quarter in Timbuktu?
- 4 A. [10:45:33] Well, he was the president of the AMUPI, by which you should
- 5 understand, the Association for the Unity and Progress of Muslims. He is the
- 6 regional president in Timbuktu, and, as such, he is also a civil servant of the state
- 7 because he is a researcher and a professor at the centre of documents for manuscripts.
- 8 He is also an imam who encourages people to pray and it is he who authorises
- 9 such-and-such an individual to pray or not in Timbuktu.
- 10 Q. [10:46:53] Now, Mr Witness, at page 16 today, you referred to concerns
- 11 regarding tourism and the need for Timbuktu to remain authentic. Do you recall
- 12 a gathering that was organised in September 2010 to denounce secular education,
- 13 western tourism and to call for -- and the state's lack of support for Islamic education?
- 14 A. [10:47:43] No, I do not recall. However, I do know that the men of culture and
- 15 the religious individuals would fight to maintain Timbuktu's identity and for -- in
- terms of respect for places of worship and religious buildings, such as, mausoleums,
- 17 cemeteries et cetera. But these men of culture, who also are the men who attempt to
- 18 protect our culture and our crafts so these locations, these mausoleums and
- 19 cemeteries, are the coveted areas for people who come to visit Timbuktu.
- 20 So these two categories go hand in hand when working together, but I do not have
- 21 any recollection of an assignment of this type. With regard to Islamic education, I do
- 22 not recall.
- 23 THE INTERPRETER: [10:49:22] Could the witness please be requested to look up.
- 24 He is looking down all the time.
- 25 MS TAYLOR: [10:49:30] Mr Witness, the interpreters have asked if when you're

ICC-01/12-01/18

- speaking, you could have your face upward so they can catch your voice into the
- 2 microphone.
- 3 THE INTERPRETER: [10:49:38] Message from the interpreter: We also need to see
- 4 his lips move. Thank you.
- 5 MS TAYLOR: [10:49:42] They've also indicated that they need to see your lips move,
- 6 and that makes it easier for them to interpret. Thank you very much, Mr Witness.
- 7 THE WITNESS: [10:49:58](Interpretation) Okay.
- 8 MS TAYLOR: [10:49:59]
- 9 Q. [10:50:00] If I could bring up another document. It's Defence tab 222. It's
- 10 MLI-D28-0005-7228. I think we'll need to go to the second page. We'll need to go to
- 7230 to see the title. It's tab 222. If a hard copy could be given to you, Mr Witness.
- 12 Now, the title is:
- 13 (Interpretation) "Current situation in Timbuktu: Looking forward, what shall happen?
- 14 A native wonders."
- 15 (Speaks English) It's dated 10 May 2012, and if we could go to the end of the
- document, and that is page 7237, we see the name. If that could be shown on the
- 17 screen for the witness.
- 18 You see the name: "Abdel Kader HAIDARA, Gestionnaire des Ressources
- 19 Humaines, Bamako".
- 20 (Interpretation) "Abdel Kader HAIDARA, Human Resources Manager, Bamako".
- 21 A. [10:52:08] Yes, I have seen it.
- 22 Q. [10:52:13] Is the Haidara family, is that a name of people from Timbuktu?
- 23 A. [10:52:22] Yes, there are a number of Haidara families in Timbuktu. A number.
- 24 Q. [10:52:37] Are you familiar with this name?
- 25 A. [10:52:40] Well, the Abdel Kader Haidara that I know, well, I don't know what is

ICC-01/12-01/18

- meant by "human resources manager", but he is the president of the SAVAMA-DCI,
- 2 which is a structure for the -- for safeguarding manuscripts in Timbuktu.
- 3 And on the first days of the occupation, he played a major role by getting a good
- 4 number of these manuscripts out and making them secure in the capital, Bamako.
- 5 But as to the title human resources manager, where would that be? I do not know
- 6 him according to this title.
- 7 Q. [10:53:56] Mr Witness, I don't believe it's the same individual. Do you know an
- 8 "Abdel Kader Haidara" who has links to electricity or energy?
- 9 A. [10:54:12] No.
- 10 Q. [10:54:23] Now, Mr Witness, this author writes about the *Comité des moeurs* in
- 11 Timbuktu. So I'm going to turn to that page which specifically refers to the ...
- 12 Oh, we have two people standing up.
- 13 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:54:42](Interpretation) Madam Prosecutor.
- 14 MS LUPING: [10:54:44] Mr President, I have had to repeat the same objection over
- and over again for almost every document. The simple question of, Have you seen
- this document before has not been asked. Now simply saying, "Do you know
- 17 such-and-such organisation that may or may not have written a document" is not
- 18 enough.
- 19 Now we have had the witness establish he doesn't know the individual even who has
- authored this, and we would argue that it's not appropriate simply to start delving
- 21 into a document. The fact that he states that he doesn't know the person suggests he
- 22 has never seen it. So what is the basis? What is the foundation for showing it to
- 23 this particular witness? In our submission, there is none.
- 24 Unless the Chamber would like to have a large number of documents with no link
- 25 whatsoever to the witness, which is what we currently have, then I would ask that the

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 question be asked.
- 2 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:55:49](Interpretation) Ms Taylor, I believe that
- 3 this is not the right witness for you to be able to talk about this document. You have
- 4 asked him whether he knows "Abdel Kader Haidara" and he said no. And it would
- 5 not be right to continue putting questions to him on this document of which he is
- 6 not -- with which he is not familiar.
- 7 Please continue.
- 8 MS TAYLOR: [10:56:19] Mr President, if I may be briefly heard. I'm concerned that
- 9 this is something that would lead to a mistrial. And I say that with due concern -- if
- 10 I may, Mr President, because --
- 11 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:56:29](Interpretation) No.
- 12 MS TAYLOR: [10:56:30] Mr President.
- 13 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:56:33](Interpretation) No, Ms Taylor, the
- 14 Chamber has already decided. On every objection raised, the Chamber does not
- 15 have to hand over to each party to -- for them to voice their concerns.
- 16 For this document, however, our guidelines on the conduct of proceedings are very
- 17 clear in this regard. I do not need a second opinion on this occasion.
- 18 So I have already ruled. Please move on to another subject -- on to another
- 19 document.
- 20 MS TAYLOR: [10:57:12] Mr President, if I may, during the break we can send you
- 21 every oral decision on this subject which says the opposite.
- Now I'm not attempting to authenticate this document through this witness. It's the
- 23 wrong test. And if you could only go through the preparation logs, we see:
- 24 Witness has not seen this before.
- 25 There's no rule that the witness has to have seen the document before --

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:57:36](Interpretation) Ms Taylor, Ms Taylor, you
- 2 know the situation with this Chamber. When I issue a decision, I do not want there
- 3 to be any further arguing on the point. So please move on to something else.
- 4 MS TAYLOR: [10:57:58] Mr President, I note that it is 11 o'clock, almost. Now I do
- 5 seek a point of clarification. Now, under -- it's a point of clarification. I'm going to
- 6 put questions to this witness. Now under the decision of the conduct of proceedings,
- 7 if a witness does not remember something, we are permitted to confront the witness
- 8 with documents that are not authored by the witness that speak to the specific
- 9 question that's being put to the witness.
- 10 For example, we can put extracts from another witness's testimony, even if this
- 11 witness hasn't reviewed those statements. It's not --
- 12 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:58:43](Interpretation) Ms Taylor, what are we
- 13 talking about? Are we still talking about this document by "Abdel Kader Haidara"
- or are we talking about something else?
- 15 MS TAYLOR: [10:58:58] Mr President, I'm seeking a clarification that will have an
- impact on my entire cross-examination.
- 17 Now I will put questions to this witness --
- 18 Mr President, if I may because I do have the right to cross-examine.
- 19 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:59:10](Interpretation) No, no, no, Ms Taylor, it's
- 20 not like that. The instructions on the conduct of proceedings are entirely clear.
- 21 With regard to this document we have already ruled. You shall move on to
- 22 something else. Otherwise, there is one minute remaining, we shall suspend and we
- 23 shall start again in 30 minutes on other topics.
- 24 MS TAYLOR: [10:59:40] We note that, Mr President.
- 25 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [10:59:48](Interpretation) Thank you very much,

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 Ms Taylor.
- 2 Now it is 11 o'clock. We shall rise for 30 minutes and reconvene at 11.30.
- 3 Court is suspended.
- 4 THE COURT USHER: [11:00:01] All rise.
- 5 (Recess taken at 11.00 a.m.)
- 6 (Upon resuming in open session at 11.31 a.m.)
- 7 THE COURT USHER: [11:31:16] All rise.
- 8 Please be seated.
- 9 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [11:31:32](Interpretation) The hearing shall now
- 10 resume.
- 11 Ms Taylor, you have the floor for continuation of your cross-examination.
- 12 MS TAYLOR: [11:31:55]
- 13 Q. [11:31:59] Good morning, Mr Witness, how are you?
- 14 A. [11:32:03] I'm well, Counsel.
- 15 Q. [11:32:10] Wonderful. Now, Mr Witness, before the break, we were discussing
- 16 a *Comité des moeurs* and a particular assembly. Based on your recollection, was there
- more than one assembly that took place or meeting?
- 18 A. [11:32:32] Alongside the general assembly, there were some meetings for
- 19 dialogue within a number of neighbourhoods. On the basis of concerns expressed
- 20 by people in various neighbourhoods, the general assembly was held and this was to
- 21 take into account the concerns of all the various neighbourhoods. This was
- 22 a prelude to the actual general assembly.
- 23 So these were opportunities for dialogue and consultation.
- Q. [11:33:33] So would it be fair to say that the resolutions issued by the general
- 25 assembly took into account these views and concerns expressed during these

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 neighbourhood meetings?
- 2 A. [11:33:50] Exactly.
- 3 Q. [11:34:01] Do you recall if, at any point, there was a kind of tribunal convened in
- 4 the framework of this *Comité des moeurs* where the mothers of the families expressed
- 5 their concerns regarding the comportment of their children?
- 6 A. [11:34:23] I don't remember a tribunal, a parallel tribunal, other than the official
- 7 tribunal that was there. Well, the communities could refer to someone else without
- 8 my knowing about it.
- 9 In any event, I am not aware of any such tribunal.
- 10 Q. [11:35:08] Mr Witness, is it correct that in the years leading up to 2012, there was
- a concern among the local population in Timbuktu that they won't be given the same
- treatment and advantages as the south of Mali?
- 13 A. [11:35:31] Yes. And one of the reasons for the cyclical rebellions was primarily
- 14 the imbalance between the south and the north of Mali. And I remember that same
- 15 year, 2010, I was personally affected by one of the officials from the MNLA. He
- came and he said to me that he wanted to speak out against the injustice of the central
- 17 government in Bamako. So I asked him, "What means are you going to use?" And
- 18 he said that, for the time being, they had a document with an official
- 19 acknowledgment of receipt and he showed it to me. And this document was not the
- 20 four letters. It was three letters, MNA, the Mouvement National de l'Azawad, Azawad
- 21 National Movement.
- 22 And that same week, they had an information meeting at the city hall of Timbuktu
- 23 with a number of youth leaders. Unfortunately, at that -- unfortunately, I was not
- 24 present at that meeting, but at the end of the meeting, the gentleman came back to see
- 25 me. He gave me an account, and, that same night, he was arrested by the authorities.

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 After a number of interventions, he was released.
- 2 So you see, this movement had as its main demand, they were calling for a new
- 3 balance to be struck in terms of the management of public affairs. They wanted the
- 4 south and the north to be treated equally. Put on the same footing. They wanted
- 5 a rational, logical management of the resources of the country and they wanted the
- 6 country's resources to be managed fairly.
- 7 All the people of the north agreed to this. Not just in Timbuktu, but also in Gao,
- 8 Kidal. All those regions were in favour of this because the injustice was -- was clear
- 9 to see and experienced by everyone and experienced everywhere.
- 10 However, the movement changed once it became more based on ethnicity. At that
- 11 time, the MNLA was primarily -- or, for the most part, made up of Tuareg people,
- 12 and then another group created its own camp.
- 13 So that is how I came to know that there was injustice before 2012.
- 14 The sedentary, that is to say, settled black people, also had created their camp.
- 15 Q. [11:40:37] Mr Witness, I have a number of follow-up questions.
- My first is, are you in a position to give us the name of this official from the MNA?
- 17 A. [11:40:51] Yes. Mahamane Djeri. The late Mahamane ...
- 18 THE INTERPRETER: [11:41:17] Inaudible.
- 19 THE WITNESS: [11:41:06](Interpretation) He has since passed away. He was the
- 20 number 2, the second in command, so to speak, within the MNLA.
- 21 THE INTERPRETER: [11:41:17] Interpretation correction: MNA.
- 22 MS TAYLOR: [11:41:23]
- Q. [11:41:24] I'm afraid, Mr Witness, we don't have it recorded in either the English
- 24 or the French transcript.
- Would it be possible for you to just spell the last name. We had "Mahamane", but

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 not the last name.
- 2 A. [11:41:35] Djeri Maïga. Djeri, D-J-E-R-I. Then Maïga, M-A-Ï-G-I.
- 3 THE INTERPRETER: [11:42:01] Correction: G-A.
- 4 MS TAYLOR: [11:42:07]
- 5 Q. [11:42:08] Mr Witness, did this individual have an association with the
- 6 Ganda-Koye?
- 7 A. [11:42:16] He was -- well, in relation to an earlier rebellion, he was with
- 8 Manda-Koye (phon). After the 1996 agreements, he did not benefit from anything.
- 9 And he himself decided to change camps, and history was on his -- on his side. He
- 10 was proven right.
- 11 In the new movement, there were more prominent people. More missions were
- 12 entrusted to him, and he became the direct interlocutor between his movement and
- 13 the state.
- 14 So there you have it.
- 15 THE INTERPRETER: [11:43:36] Interpreter correction: The witness mentioned
- 16 Ganda-Koye at the beginning of his reply. "He was a militant of Ganda-Koye."
- 17 MS TAYLOR: [11:43:47]
- 18 Q. [11:43:48](Overlapping speakers) Mr Witness, you said: He himself decided to
- 19 change camps, and history was on his side. He was proven right in the new
- 20 movement.
- 21 Is this referring still to the MNA?
- 22 A. [11:44:04] No. I said "MNA". That is when he showed me that document.
- 23 That's when it was three letters in the acronym, but then later, it became four letters,
- 24 MNLA, National Movement for the Liberation of the Azawad. That is when there
- 25 was a separation for two reasons. First of all, the movement became more based on

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 ethnicity; and then secondly, the mention of liberation.
- 2 They agreed to revolt so as to obtain fair use of resources, but not to break up the
- 3 country. Not to separate -- not for separation. That was the difference.
- 4 And, you see, it also -- there were differences between the sedentary, that is to say, the
- 5 non-nomadic people and those who established the MNLA.
- 6 Q. [11:45:20] Now, Mr Witness, you've referred to concerns being expressed of
- 7 injustice.
- 8 Based on what you heard and saw before 2012, were there concerns regarding the
- 9 effectiveness of this civil administration in Timbuktu?
- 10 A. [11:45:36] Like the governance throughout the entire country, that is what was
- 11 experienced as well by the citizens of Timbuktu. And -- but denouncing the people
- of Timbuktu, that wasn't just the administration.
- 13 In terms of education, there were not many schools -- not many classrooms, and
- 14 people spoke out against the complete lack of state representatives in some locations.
- 15 And also demilitarisation of the north, that opened up a space or an opportunity for
- anyone with bad intentions.
- 17 So this -- these were the things that citizens were speaking out against. And bad
- 18 governance was sensed throughout the entire country. You could smell it. Not just
- 19 in Timbuktu.
- 20 Q. [11:47:45] Now, in terms of bad governance, was corruption an issue?
- 21 A. [11:47:54] Yes. Corruption, favourtism. These were words often used against
- 22 the administration. Above all, when it turns to justice, there were no lawyers in
- 23 Timbuktu. Not just before 2012, but before and -- unless it can be proven otherwise.
- 24 There were serious problems.
- Q. [11:48:49] Do you recall whether there were protests in June and July 2011 in

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 Timbuktu concerning the -- the situation regarding civil administration and justice?
- 2 A. [11:49:02] Yes. These were demonstrations that brought together thousands of
- 3 people because at the time, the judge, who was there, had been denounced
- 4 because -- because he dealt with problems quite openly, right out in the open.
- 5 The hospital, for example, there was the same sort of problems. Some healthcare
- 6 workers were scamming the patients, hitting them up for money. There were
- 7 complaints from various neighbourhoods. The local media talked about these
- 8 problems. And once people had had it with the case of a black merchant and
- 9 a light-skinned gentleman, the judge had sided with one party, and that was -- that
- 10 was it. It was the straw that broke the camel's back. And the people went out
- calling for the judge to be dismissed as well as the CEO of the hospital. And that
- 12 happened that same -- they wanted that to happen the same week. Otherwise,
- anything that would happen would be the state's problem because, you see, these
- 14 people were not accepted by the community.
- 15 Q. [11:51:40] And why were they not accepted by the community?
- 16 A. [11:51:46] I gave the example of the one particular judge who made bad
- decisions when dealing with problems. And, at the hospital, some of the workers
- there, people provided evidence. Some people who were ill, even died.
- 19 The people had had it up to here, and that's why the march occurred.
- 20 MS TAYLOR: [11:52:20] Now, I'm going to play a video, and I believe it will be
- 21 necessary to play it in private session. And then we can go into open session for
- some of the questions, and I can explain why in private session.
- 23 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [11:52:45](Interpretation) Private session, courtroom
- 24 officer, please.
- 25 (Private session at 11.52 a.m.)

(Private Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 THE COURT OFFICER: [11:52:55] We are in private session, Mr President.
- 2 (Redacted)
- 3 (Redacted)
- 4 (Redacted)
- 5 (Redacted)
- 6 (Redacted)
- 7 (Redacted)
- 8 (Redacted)
- 9 (Redacted)
- 10 (Redacted)
- 11 (Redacted)
- 12 (Redacted)
- 13 (Redacted)
- 14 (Redacted)
- 15 (Redacted)
- 16 (Redacted)
- 17 (Redacted)
- 18 (Redacted)
- 19 (Redacted)
- 20 (Redacted)
- 21 (Redacted)
- 22 (Redacted)
- 23 (Redacted)
- 24 (Redacted)
- 25 (Redacted)

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

MLI-OTP-P-0654

(Private Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 (Redacted)
- 2 (Redacted)
- 3 (Redacted)
- 4 (Open session at 11.59 a.m.)
- 5 THE COURT OFFICER: [11:59:00] We're back in open session, Mr President.
- 6 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [11:59:09](Interpretation) Thank you very much.
- 7 Ms Taylor.
- 8 MS TAYLOR: [11:59:14]
- 9 Q. [11:59:15] Mr Witness, in the extract we just heard, we heard the individual refer
- 10 at line 30 of the transcript to:
- "[...] le vol qui était amplifié à un certain moment [...]"
- 12 (Speaks English) Based on what you saw and heard in Timbuktu, was this referring to
- the pillaging and theft committed by the MNLA and Arab militia at the beginning of
- 14 April 2012?
- 15 A. [11:59:49] Well, the author here is not referring to a specific case but to a general
- situation, an observation in the years before the occupation and up until the time of
- 17 the occupation. Because when he talks about -- about returning to traditional values,
- such as respect for women, normally, in a civilised and respected society, women
- 19 should not have to endure catcalls in the street or a girl -- or girls either.
- 20 So I'm talking about respect for our customs, given that everything should be
- 21 extremely discreet. And, there's a reason for that. By way of your behaviour, be it
- 22 good or bad ... not influence the other people.
- 23 So there you have it.
- 24 So in the case of theft, even before the arrival of the MNLA, there were hold-ups, even
- 25 in houses, in private homes. And the people were no longer in the -- in the habit of

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 sleeping outside.
- 2 Now with the occupation, the first armed groups and the militia, the MNLA, they
- 3 activated this practice by turning the city into a jungle and those people who had
- 4 weapons were the strongest. Some people were stripped of their possessions.
- 5 And this did not escape the -- even the occupants of that time, the Ansar Dine
- 6 movement, which had thieves, rapists, among their ranks.
- 7 Q. [12:03:04] Mr Witness, you've said that the Ansar Dine movement had thieves
- 8 and rapists among their ranks.
- 9 Are you referring to Bocar, the Burkinabe?
- 10 Is that the incident you're referring to?
- 11 A. [12:03:25] Yes. The flagrant case of Bocar. And the Islamist combatant who
- 12 was the guard at the Hotel Azalai who would embezzle the equipment. And it was
- 13 after Adama led an investigation that he was caught and he was publicly punished.
- 14 So you find bad eggs everywhere. So their punishment limited damage within their
- 15 movement itself.
- 16 Q. [12:04:28] Mr Witness, you've referred to limiting damage. Did the installation
- of a system of policing and protection for civilians, did that assist with protecting
- 18 civilians against theft and crime in 2012?
- 19 A. [12:04:41] Well, as I said, any occupation has its pros and cons. I, as any other
- 20 native of Timbuktu, was hostile to the weapons that were circulating. That really
- 21 was a negative point. A positive point was that at least the circulation was well
- 22 regulated, the traffic was well regulated. And there was a virtual state of siege that
- 23 was not called as such. But at a given moment in time, there was nobody out in the
- 24 streets. So this was something that could stop the thieves from conducting their
- 25 activities during the night.

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 There was also a curfew that wasn't announced as such that stopped or put a stop to
- 2 any activity that could be embarrassing for these major figures. Whilst some of the
- 3 erudite individuals were reading the Koran, some others might have been playing
- 4 music.
- 5 But there was this curfew in place. So reading the Koran and playing music side by
- 6 side -- this was something that was incompatible. And, this was one of the
- 7 advantages that came out of that period, the fact that each thief is aware that if they
- 8 act, they will be punished. And this was something that really put a stop to theft in
- 9 Timbuktu.
- 10 There we have it.
- 11 Q. [12:07:23] In terms of negative aspects, the author states: (Speaks French)
- 12 THE INTERPRETER: [12:07:39] Could the interpreter please be told which and
- where we are reading from. Thank you.
- 14 MS TAYLOR: [12:07:45] I apologise to the interpreters. It's page 345 of the
- transcripts, lines 33 to 37.
- 16 MS TAYLOR: [12:07:53]
- 17 Q. [12:07:54] (Speaks French)
- 18 (Interpretation) Furthermore, I would also like to call upon them to exert less pressure
- 19 and to communicate with a society that is already organised. We have imams. We
- 20 have notables. We have cadis. They can communicate with those individuals to
- 21 get their message across, so -- so people come 'round or return to their previous
- 22 behaviour.
- 23 (Speaks English) Now, Mr Witness, is it correct that the author believed that it would
- be helpful for there to be more interaction and engagement between the locals and the
- 25 Islamists?

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 A. [12:08:43] Yes. This is what was lacking in their behaviour. And this was
- 2 denounced by one of their major spiritual chiefs, Abdel ...
- 3 THE INTERPRETER: [12:09:03] The interpreter did not catch the rest of the name.
- 4 THE WITNESS: [12:09:09](Interpretation) So the author said that he was going to
- 5 encourage them to exert less pressure because this pressure was the weapon that was
- 6 not known to the population.
- 7 If you enter a mosque with a weapon, if you come to a pharmacy with a weapon, if
- 8 you go to a school carrying a weapon, this is really the greatest form of pressure that
- 9 the population could have experienced, whilst there could have been a possibility to
- 10 exchange or conduct exchanges with a society that was already well organised and
- 11 had taken its responsibilities.
- 12 There needed only to be a small alliance for the message to be followed to the letter.
- 13 That was the vision of the author of this piece.
- 14 MS TAYLOR: [12:10:18]
- 15 Q. [12:10:19] At transcript 132, page 39, line 3, there's a quote referring to
- 16 Mr Al Hassan as being:
- 17 "[...] shy, peace-loving, and friendly for those who knew him in 2012."
- Now, Mr Witness, did the presence of Al Hassan in the Islamic police help with this
- 19 process of dialogue and engagement?
- 20 A. [12:10:50] Well, nobody's perfect. We have to acknowledge that. Maybe for
- 21 those who approached him, they might have found him endowed with such qualities.
- 22 Others will say quite the contrary.
- 23 Timid. Well, he wasn't that talkative. Accessible, that's obvious. By virtue of his
- origins, the fact that he comes from there, that he is known to everybody, that he
- 25 knows everybody. And those are some of his virtues for those who had the luck to

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 approach him.
- 2 Q. [12:12:08] And, Mr Witness, did these virtues assist with your recommendation
- 3 that there be communication between the Islamists and the locals?
- 4 A. [12:12:42] Well, at a given moment in time, what I didn't understand was that
- 5 the national union of young Malians who, most of the leaders in 2010 had supported,
- 6 and whose resolutions they had supported they were the first to scarper in 2012
- 7 when they fled the city.
- 8 So I had the opportunity to tell them in 2010, that: You implored God for us to
- 9 return to our ancestral values, for Timbuktu to be all that you want it to be and God
- 10 complied. But this time, by bringing you men carrying weapons. If you had
- followed the political course, you wouldn't have fled and you would have got the
- message through. But your absence meant that there was a vacuum, and, ultimately,
- it was the weapons that got that message across.
- So this is to say that, contrary to what this *Comité des moeurs* was looking for, to my
- 15 mind, one had to understand that the better idea was to meet these Islamists and to
- say to them that we are working on it, rather than fleeing and leaving everything up
- 17 to them.
- 18 So everything that the Islamists prohibited at that moment in time was contained in
- 19 the resolutions that came out of the assembly general of the *Comité des moeurs*, with
- 20 the exception of the application of the Sharia.
- 21 There we are.
- 22 MS TAYLOR: [12:15:20] Mr President, I'm going to play another extract from the
- video and then I can go again into open session.
- 24 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:15:35](Interpretation) So we shall now move into
- 25 private session, is that it?

(Private Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 MS TAYLOR: [12:15:38] Yes, with your permission.
- 2 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:15:42](Interpretation) Courtroom Officer, private
- 3 session, please.
- 4 (Private session at 12.15 p.m.)
- 5 THE COURT OFFICER: [12:15:46] We're in private session, Mr President.
- 6 (Redacted)
- 7 (Redacted)
- 8 (Redacted)
- 9 (Redacted)
- 10 (Redacted)
- 11 (Redacted)
- 12 (Redacted)
- 13 (Redacted)
- 14 (Redacted)
- 15 (Redacted)
- 16 (Redacted)
- 17 (Redacted)
- 18 (Redacted)
- 19 (Redacted)
- 20 (Redacted)
- 21 (Redacted)
- 22 (Redacted)
- 23 (Redacted)
- 24 (Redacted)
- 25 (Redacted)

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

MLI-OTP-P-0654

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

MLI-OTP-P-0654

(Private Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 (Redacted)
- 2 (Redacted)
- 3 (Redacted)
- 4 (Redacted)
- 5 (Open session at 12.21 p.m.)
- 6 THE COURT OFFICER: [12:21:07] We are back in open session, Mr President.
- 7 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:21:12](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 8 Mr Courtroom Officer.
- 9 Ms Taylor.
- 10 MS TAYLOR: [12:21:15]
- 11 Q. [12:21:15] Now, Mr Witness I'm going to read a very short extract and put
- 12 a question.
- 13 For the interpreters, it's page 0346 lines 63 to 68.
- 14 And, the author states:
- 15 (Interpretation) "But I'm talking about a war. I do not believe that that is the solution.
- 16 The solution is what we understand. The Sharia for us, is already part of our
- 17 education. If we" --
- 18 THE INTERPRETER: [12:21:55] I'm still waiting for it to come up on the screen. It
- 19 is not yet on the screen. Excuse me.
- 20 MS TAYLOR: [12:21:58] I apologise to the interpreters and to Mr Witness. The
- 21 interpreter is waiting for it to be shown on the screen.
- I believe it's on the screen now. I'll just continue.
- 23 (Interpretation) "The Sharia for us, is already part of our education, it doesn't want to
- 24 do us any harm. And if as good Muslims we accept it, accept with our social
- organisation, with our notables, that it be applied, I think that the best formula it

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 would be a better formula than to see bombs falling on our buildings and on
- 2 ourselves."
- 3 End of sight translation.
- 4 MS TAYLOR: [12:23:01]
- 5 Q. [12:23:01] Now, Mr Witness, is it correct that since Sharia law is part of your
- 6 culture, it was preferable to choose a form of Sharia that involved Timbuktu notables
- 7 and locals over the possibility of war and civilian casualties?
- 8 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:23:25](Interpretation) Madam Prosecutor.
- 9 MS LUPING: [12:23:28] Mr President, your Honours, there are about at least three
- 10 contentions in one question. It's a compound question. I would simply request,
- 11 Mr President, that it be reformulated.
- 12 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:23:46](Interpretation) Ms Taylor.
- 13 MS TAYLOR: [12:23:47] Mr President, if I may, this is all based on what's been said
- in the lines before.
- Now, this is -- again, I'm aware we're in open session. There are certain questions
- that have already been put to this witness that authenticate the contents of the
- document. I can rephrase it, but I do hope we don't have to raise questions that are
- 18 identifying to the witness.
- 19 I've just said I will rephrase it. I don't think it's necessary for the Prosecutor to again
- 20 respond.
- 21 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:24:30](Interpretation) Ms Taylor, I believe that
- 22 Madam Prosecutor's observation is well founded because we are here avoiding
- 23 multistoreyed questions.
- 24 So please rephrase.
- 25 MS TAYLOR: [12:24:46]

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 Q. [12:24:48] Mr Witness, the author of this extract stated that Sharia law was part
- 2 of your culture. The author also states that they thought the best solution was to
- 3 accept it with their social organisation, with the notables to apply it.
- 4 Is it correct that there were persons in Timbuktu, such as yourself, who believed it
- 5 was better to apply Sharia with the involvement of locals and notables at this point?
- 6 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:25:45](Interpretation) Madam Prosecutor.
- 7 MS LUPING: [12:25:50] Mr President, your Honours, besides the fact that we've
- 8 just -- we, again, have a compound question, my objection is a new one, which is this
- 9 also now calls for speculation. The witness is not an expert being called to provide
- 10 his opinion on matters in which he -- he can only speak for himself. But now we're
- being asked -- he's being asked to give an opinion in relation to others as well.
- 12 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:26:17](Interpretation) Madam Prosecutor, I do
- 13 not follow you here. The witness was present in Timbuktu and he can at least give
- 14 us his feeling or sentiment.
- 15 Ms Taylor.
- 16 MS TAYLOR: [12:26:34] I'm also avoiding referring to the identity of the author.
- 17 Q. [12:26:38] So, Mr Witness, could you kindly -- could you please respond to my
- 18 question.
- 19 Now, this author has stated something. Is it correct, based on what you saw and
- 20 heard, that persons such as, the author and yourself considered it preferable for
- 21 Sharia to be applied with the involvement of notables, rather than risk the possibility
- 22 of war?
- 23 A. [12:27:10] Yes. The author has here provided a personal opinion, and in
- 24 listening to what he has to say, this is a personal opinion that he has provided. And
- 25 in supporting him in his reaction, I would say that the authentic person hailing from

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 Timbuktu was already under the Sharia before the occupiers arrived. I would say to
- 2 you that the manner in which society was organised in Timbuktu meant that with the
- 3 prohibitions that were ongoing, there were fewer cases going to court.
- 4 Each community has a cadi, and, in Timbuktu, there is the office of the cadi. And
- 5 before a case arrives at the office of the cadi, people would meet or refer to the doyen
- 6 of the sector even before coming to the cadi. And when it comes to the head of the
- 7 sector, then they would also talk to the customary chief. And when the matter is
- 8 overly complex, then they would consult the imam who could then refer it to the cadi.
- 9 So you can see the various steps that are taken, and this is what was recommended
- 10 under the religion and Timbuktu has already -- always functioned like this. And the
- *intronisation* of the cadi is a special event.
- 12 The fact of prohibiting smoking -- well, Timbuktu, for many years, it was formally
- prohibited for people to smoke in a gathering. It is formally prohibited to smoke in
- 14 front of an elder -- or to smoke because one is respecting customs.
- 15 One cannot stop and talk to somebody else's wife or girl in the street. So that is the
- 16 culture of Timbuktu that goes hand in hand with the Sharia.
- Now, as for other forms of punishment, such as amputation, these are not developed
- as such, but there are more severe punishments that could be rejected by society.
- 19 These were things that already existed in Timbuktu.
- 20 So all of that was abandoned, set to one side. And they -- maybe people thought to
- 21 themselves, "Well, if we use weapons, then we can force the inhabitants of Timbuktu
- 22 to practice Sharia once again," I say to myself.
- 23 But everything that was said was only said and only is the opinion of the author.
- 24 What he says and what he writes is his own opinion. He is not speaking on behalf of
- 25 a community.

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 Q. [12:31:41] Now, Mr Witness, I'm just going to ask you to provide one response
- 2 as to a further few lines.
- 3 And for the interpreters, it's again on page 0346. It's lines eight -- 86 to 88. And the
- 4 author has been asked about the application of Sharia in the north, and the author
- 5 responds:
- 6 (Interpretation) "Yes, in the North, that ... that depends ... the North was affected, but
- 7 does that mean the entire North accept Sharia law? Myself, I'm not speaking on
- 8 behalf of the people of TIMBUKTU, but I think that Sharia law would not bother
- 9 or -- would not bother TIMBUKTU."
- 10 (Speaks English) Mr Witness, do you share this opinion?
- 11 A. [12:32:44] Yes, I do share that opinion. The author who already was
- 12 accustomed to Sharia law is now ... And ...
- 13 THE INTERPRETER: [12:33:09] Interruption.
- 14 MS TAYLOR: [12:33:11] I apologise, Mr Witness. I thought you'd finished.
- 15 THE WITNESS: [12:33:19](Interpretation) And I said in light of everything I
- 16 explained, Sharia law should not actually bother a person from Timbuktu if that
- 17 person has been properly educated. The same religious organisation exists in
- 18 Timbuktu and I don't see why one would be afraid. And people who did not want
- 19 Sharia law to be practised were usually wrongdoers. People who stole. Rapists.
- 20 Those who broke divine law. They were the ones who feared the application of
- 21 Sharia law.
- 22 In general terms, I think that in Timbuktu, everyone who -- believes that the stability
- 23 of Timbuktu depends on justice. This is what these people think. The proof of that
- 24 is that just like Mali itself, where traditional authorities were out and out set aside,
- 25 put on the sidelines -- no longer take part in decision-making, this weakened the state.

(Private Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- Otherwise, by giving all the power to the representatives of the state and only to the
- 2 justice system, all of these things went off the rails. No one has a monopoly on
- 3 providing guidance or exercising power in this world.
- 4 So if the traditional authorities had still been involved for example, the imam, the
- 5 cadi, the traditional *chefs* I think that -- I think that we would have gotten out of that
- 6 crisis in a better condition and -- or it might not even have happened.
- 7 Q. [12:36:34] I'm going to bring up another article. It's OTP tab 56,
- 8 MLI-OTP-0068-4637. And if it could not be shown to the public.
- 9 MS TAYLOR: [12:36:58] And, Mr President, if I could go very briefly into private
- session; it will be just one question -- well, actually, not even a question.
- 11 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:37:09](Interpretation) Certainly. Private
- 12 session, courtroom officer.
- 13 (Private session at 12.37 p.m.)
- 14 THE COURT OFFICER: [12:37:16] We are in private session, Mr President.
- 15 (Redacted)
- 16 (Redacted)
- 17 (Redacted)
- 18 (Redacted)
- 19 (Redacted)
- 20 (Redacted)
- 21 (Redacted)
- 22 (Redacted)
- 23 (Redacted)
- 24 (Redacted)
- 25 (Open session at 12.38 p.m.)

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 THE COURT OFFICER: [12:38:13] We are back in open session, Mr President.
- 2 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:38:22](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 3 Courtroom Officer.
- 4 Ms Taylor.
- 5 MS TAYLOR: [12:38:27]
- 6 Q. [12:38:27] Now, Mr Witness, do you have a hard copy of the document with you?
- 7 It's tab 56 from the Prosecution binder.
- 8 A. [12:38:49] I'm looking for it just now.
- 9 Q. [12:38:53] And in the meantime, perhaps we could scroll down to see the text on
- this page on evidence 1.
- 11 Now, Mr Witness, this document states -- it's referring to "Lahsane" or Al Hassan.
- 12 And in the second paragraph, the document states:
- 13 (Interpretation) "Yes he was the second in command at the Islamic police just after the
- 14 punishment inflicted on Adama by the Islamist hierarchy."
- 15 (Speaks English) Now, based on your own personal recollections, do you recall that
- 16 Al Hassan took up this position after Adama was decommissioned?
- 17 A. [12:40:06] Yes.
- 18 Q. [12:40:13] This document then has written:
- 19 (Interpretation) "Shy, peace loving and friendly in the eyes of those who knew him in
- 20 20- -- year 2012."
- 21 A. [12:40:33] Yes, indeed, he did have those virtues.
- Q. [12:40:44] Now, the author is saying "for those who he welcomed in 2012,"
- 23 did -- did you hear whether anyone else shared that point of view? Did anyone else
- 24 have that impression?
- 25 A. [12:40:57] Yes. I would have liked to have said, perhaps in private session --

(Private Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

1 Q. [12:41:27] Mr Witness, we can go into private session.

2 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:41:33](Interpretation) Courtroom officer.

3 (Private session at 12.41 p.m.)

4 THE COURT OFFICER: [12:41:41] We are in private session, Mr President.

Trial Hearing (Private Session)
MLI-OTP-P-0654

15.09.2021 Page 56

Trial Hearing (Private Session) ICC-01/12-01/18 MLI-OTP-P-0654

- 1 (Redacted)
- 2 (Redacted)
- 3 (Redacted)
- 4 (Redacted)
- 5 (Redacted)
- 6 (Redacted)
- 7 (Redacted)
- 8 (Redacted)
- 9 (Redacted)
- 10 (Redacted)
- 11 (Redacted)
- 12 (Open session at 12.47 p.m.)
- 13 THE COURT OFFICER: [12:47:32] We are back in open session, Mr President.
- 14 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:47:36](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 15 courtroom officer.
- 16 Ms Taylor.
- 17 MS TAYLOR: [12:47:43] Now, on page 4638, I'm going to read out from line 7. If
- 18 the interpreters could indicate if they have it in front of them. It starts with:
- 19 "L'homme était plus fréquent ..."
- 20 THE INTERPRETER: [12:48:08] English interpreter is ready.
- 21 MS TAYLOR:
- 22 Q. [12:48:14] It states:
- 23 THE INTERPRETER: [12:48:17] Sight translation:
- 24 (Interpretation) "The man was more frequently at his office because he served both as
- 25 interpreter between his boss and those who came with complaints, and as a duty

(Private Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 officer to deal with routine matters. He was less seen in the field contrary to
- 2 everyone who accused him of things."
- 3 MS TAYLOR:
- 4 Q. [12:48:52] Mr Witness, does this correspond to what you yourself recall?
- 5 A. [12:48:58] Yes, exactly.
- 6 First of all, when I would go to the police station, he was there. And, I didn't see him
- 7 in the field during the destruction -- in any event, I didn't see him.
- 8 Q. [12:49:46] Now, Mr Witness, at transcript 128 it's page 38, lines 3 to 9, and lines
- 9 17 to 25 (Redacted)
- 10 (Redacted)
- 11 (Redacted)
- 12 (Redacted)
- 13 (Redacted)
- 14 (Redacted)
- 15 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:50:50](Interpretation) Madam Prosecutor.
- 16 MS LUPING: [12:50:52] Mr President, just a request. If we could please go into
- 17 private session. This was deliberately sought in private session -- this
- information -- and we do believe this is -- this is identifying.
- 19 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:51:09](Interpretation) Private session, courtroom
- 20 officer.
- 21 (Private session at 12.51 p.m.)
- 22 THE COURT OFFICER: [12:51:19] We are in private session, Mr President.
- 23 (Redacted)
- 24 (Redacted)
- 25 (Redacted)

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

MLI-OTP-P-0654

	WLI-O11-1-0004
1	
2	
3	
4	
5	
6	
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	Page redacted - Private session.
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
2425	
75	(Open session at 12.57 p.m.)

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

MLI-OTP-P-0654

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 THE COURT OFFICER: [12:57:50] We're back in open session, Mr President.
- 2 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:58:01](Interpretation) Thank you very much.
- 3 Ms Taylor.
- 4 MS TAYLOR: [12:58:06] Mr President -- oh, sorry --
- 5 Q. [12:58:08] Mr Witness, I apologise, what we just heard, does this correspond to
- 6 what you yourself recall from 2012?
- 7 A. [12:58:16] Indeed. In 2012, nowhere did I see -- I didn't see the destruction of
- 8 the mausoleums. And the events relating to the amputation and the punishment, I
- 9 don't remember seeing Al Hassan in such a position.
- 10 MS TAYLOR: [12:59:16] Mr President, I'm looking at the time. It's one o'clock.
- 11 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:59:24](Interpretation) Quite so, Ms Taylor. It is
- one minute to one, and I think we can break now for our lunch, and we will resume at
- 13 2.30.
- 14 But I believe we're still in private session.
- 15 THE COURT OFFICER: [12:59:42] (Overlapping speakers) We are in open session,
- 16 Mr President.
- 17 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [12:59:46](Interpretation) Very well. I was
- 18 mistaken.
- 19 We will now suspend. The hearing shall now -- is now suspended.
- 20 THE COURT USHER: [12:59:56] All rise.
- 21 (Recess taken at 12.59 p.m.)
- 22 (Upon resuming in open session at 2.33 p.m.)
- 23 THE COURT USHER: [14:33:20] All rise.
- 24 Please be seated.
- 25 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [14:33:39](Interpretation) Court is in session.

(Private Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- The Defence has the floor for the follow-up of the cross-examination. 1
- 2 Ms Taylor.
- 3 MS TAYLOR: [14:34:00]
- 4 Q. [14:34:01] Good afternoon, Mr Witness, how are you?
- 5 A. [14:34:05] I'm well.
- 6 O. [14:34:11] Now, Mr Witness, I have a very few amount of questions where I'm
- 7 going to refer to your work. I'm not going to describe it in any way. And I would
- 8 ask that in your answers that you also not describe it, as we are presently in open
- 9 session. But if you feel that you need to go into private session to respond, if you
- 10 could just kindly raise your hand.
- 11 A. [14:34:42](No interpretation)
- 12 Q. [14:34:43] Thank you very much.
- 13 Now, Mr Witness, apart from trips to other cities, is it correct that you continued to
- 14 live in Timbuktu throughout 2012?
- 15 [14:34:59] Yes. A.
- 16 [14:35:12] And did you feel constrained to stay in Timbuktu for family reasons?
- 17 A. [14:35:21] First of all, not only family reasons.
- 18 MS TAYLOR: [14:35:45] Mr President, if we can go into private session.
- 19 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [14:35:51](Interpretation) Court officer.
- 20 (Private session at 2.35 p.m.)
- 21 THE COURT OFFICER: [14:35:58] We're in private session, Mr President.
- 22 (Redacted)
- 23 (Redacted)
- 24 (Redacted)
- 25 (Redacted)

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

MLI-OTP-P-0654

	Trial Hearing MLI-OTP-P-0654	(Private Session)	ICC-01/12-01/18
1	(Redacted)		
2	(Redacted)		
3	(Redacted)		
4	(Redacted)		
5	(Redacted)		
6	(Redacted)		
7	(Redacted)		
8	(Redacted)		
9	(Redacted)		
10	(Redacted)		
11	(Redacted)		
12	(Redacted)		
13	(Redacted)		
14	(Redacted)		
15	(Redacted)		
16	(Redacted)		
17	(Redacted)		
18	(Redacted)		
19	(Redacted)		
20	(Open session at 2.41 p.m.)		
21	THE COURT OFFICER: [14:41:2	[3] We're back in open session, Mr P	resident.
22	PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA:	[14:41:37](Interpretation) Thank you	ı very much,
23	Court Officer.		
24	Ms Taylor.		

15.09.2021 Page 64

25

MS TAYLOR: [14:41:40]

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 Q. [14:41:42] Now, Mr Witness, speaking of this early period of 2012, at transcript
- 2 127, page 23, line 17 to 19, you spoke of people going to Bamako.
- 3 At this time period, was there also an exodus of Tuaregs and Arabs to the refugee
- 4 camps in surrounding countries?
- 5 A. [14:42:10] Indeed, this occupation didn't just happen against one ethnic group.
- 6 The occupation came for the communities living in Timbuktu. It wasn't just blacks.
- 7 Everybody was in their different localities where they could be received. But there
- 8 were others who didn't have relatives but they were accepted in the refugee camps, if
- 9 you talk about the camp of Mbera, Mauritania, and a lot of others also in Burkina Faso.
- 10 Tuaregs, Songhai people, Mauritanians, Tuareg, Arabs -- Niger, Algeria, all the
- 11 neighbouring countries received people who had fled, firstly, because of fear.
- 12 Others fled due to possible reprisals, and, sometimes -- not to mention that I was
- present -- they would -- they preferred not to be present. They preferred to be far
- 14 from the situation.
- 15 Q. [14:43:58] Mr Witness, you've referred to "reprisals." Based on what you saw
- and heard in these beginning months of 2012, were some of the members of Timbuktu
- 17 concerned about attacks or reprisals by the Malian army?
- 18 A. [14:44:15] Are you speaking about 2012? Before 2012? I haven't understood
- 19 the question.
- 20 Q. [14:44:38](Overlapping speakers) Yes, Mr Witness, the -- for example, between
- 21 January and March 2012, the beginning of the year?
- 22 A. [14:44:50] Well, throughout the crisis, you had the whole rebellion, and,
- 23 throughout that time, you had people who left. 2006, 2012, there were waves of
- 24 people who left. There were waves of refugees.
- Now, the reasons as to why people fled, they're different. Some people

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 were -- feared the return of the army. They thought that would be catastrophic for
- 2 them. People were also afraid of the power of a Tuareg-ethnic group. Certain
- 3 sedentary black people were afraid of that. Fear meant that a lot of people preferred
- 4 to leave from all the different crises that occurred.
- 5 It wasn't just 2012, and -- still today, you still have people who have fled since 2011.
- 6 Q. [14:46:23] Mr Witness, do you recall an incident in September 2012 concerning
- 7 the death of 16 Dawa preachers?
- 8 A. [14:46:36] Sixteen ...? Yes, I heard about that, but it wasn't in the area of
- 9 Timbuktu.
- 10 Q. [14:47:02] Did six of these preachers come from Timbuktu?
- 11 A. [14:47:09] Well, they mentioned them, but I didn't know them.
- 12 Q. [14:47:18] Did the Arab population in Timbuktu organise a march to express
- 13 concern following these deaths?
- 14 A. [14:47:32] I don't think there was a march. Well, yes, I do remember, but the
- march, first of all, came with the French-Serval intervention. And, at the same time,
- it was deploring the death indeed of this delegation.
- 17 Q. [14:48:09] I'm just going to bring up Defence tab 54, MLI-OTP-0012-1854. It's
- a photograph that was (indiscernible) date of 12 September 2012. And,
- 19 Mr Witness --
- 20 MS TAYLOR: [14:48:31] It shouldn't be shown to the public.
- 21 Q. [14:48:32] But if you could confirm if you have it in front of you, either the hard
- copy or on evidence 1.
- 23 A. [14:48:51] I don't have it.
- 24 Q. [14:48:54] Mr Witness, can you see it now on evidence 1?
- 25 I'll have to, with the permission of the Chamber, ask one question in private session.

(Private Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [14:49:11](Interpretation) Court officer.
- 2 (Private session at 2.49 p.m.)
- 3 THE COURT OFFICER: [14:49:22] We are in private session, Mr President.
- 4 (Redacted)
- 5 (Redacted)
- 6 (Redacted)
- 7 (Redacted)
- 8 (Redacted)
- 9 (Redacted)
- 10 (Redacted)
- 11 (Redacted)
- 12 (Redacted)
- 13 (Redacted)
- 14 (Redacted)
- 15 (Redacted)
- 16 (Redacted)
- 17 (Redacted)
- 18 (Redacted)
- 19 (Redacted)
- 20 (Redacted)
- 21 (Redacted)
- 22 (Redacted)
- 23 (Redacted)
- 24 (Redacted)
- 25 (Redacted)

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

MLI-OTP-P-0654

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

MLI-OTP-P-0654

(Private Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 (Redacted)
- 2 (Redacted)
- 3 (Redacted)
- 4 (Redacted)
- 5 (Redacted)
- 6 (Redacted)
- 7 (Redacted)
- 8 (Open session at 2.58 p.m.)
- 9 THE COURT OFFICER: [14:58:32] We are back in open session, Mr President.
- 10 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [14:58:44](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 11 court officer.
- 12 Ms Taylor.
- 13 MS TAYLOR: [14:58:51]
- 14 Q. [14:58:51] Mr Witness, just to recall, we are in open session.
- 15 Now this document refers to a meeting in September. Does that refresh your
- 16 memory as to when this march occurred?
- 17 A. [14:59:03] Yes, indeed.
- 18 Q. [14:59:20] The note --
- 19 A. [14:59:25] In 2012, indeed. The Arab community had organised a march to
- 20 protest against the killings in Diabaly. This was an initiative from the Arab
- 21 community, the president thereof was a member of the community. He was a trader.
- 22 And there was the Islamic police there, and even the army. They were involved.
- Q. [15:00:14] Now, this note refers to the Arab community being a victim in 1992
- 24 and 2006. Based on what you saw and heard from the people marching, were they
- 25 concerned about the possibility of being victims again?

(Private Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18 MLI-OTP-P-0654

- 1 A. [15:00:33] Indeed. These were people who were worried. And that is why the
- 2 spokesperson in his speech said that we do not want what happened in the other
- 3 rebellions -- we do not want people to continue to be a victim of such incidents.
- 4 So it was a reminder, it was a SOS. But it was also a heartfelt message on the part of
- 5 a community that was worried.
- 6 Q. [15:01:29] Now, turning to the beginning of 2013 - and we are in open
- 7 session - did the Arab population organise another march to express their concerns
- 8 regarding hostilities and the possibility of civilian casualties?
- 9 A. [15:01:53] Yes. After the liberation, there were a number of marches, but I do
- 10 not know which march we're talking about.
- 11 Q. [15:02:24] I'm going to play a video without sound. It's -- and then I'll ask
- 12 questions. But before asking the questions, I will ask to go into private session very
- briefly. It's tab -- Defence tab 45. It's MLI-OTP-0012-1774. I'm going to play a 13
- 14 couple of seconds on evidence 1 -- evidence 2, I apologise, without sound.
- 15 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:02:57](Interpretation) Private session, please,
- 16 Mr Courtroom Officer.
- 17 (Private session at 3.03 p.m.)
- THE COURT OFFICER: [15:03:07] We're in private session, Mr President. 18
- 19 (Redacted)
- 20 (Redacted)
- 21 (Redacted)
- 22 (Redacted)
- 23 (Redacted)
- 24 (Redacted)
- 25 (Redacted)

Trial Hearing (Private Session) ICC-01/12-01/18 MLI-OTP-P-0654

- 1 (Redacted)
- 2 (Redacted)
- 3 (Redacted)
- 4 (Redacted)
- 5 (Redacted)
- 6 (Redacted)
- 7 (Redacted)
- 8 (Redacted)
- 9 (Redacted)
- 10 (Redacted)
- 11 (Redacted)
- 12 (Redacted)
- 13 (Open session at 3.05 p.m.)
- 14 THE COURT OFFICER: [15:05:04] We are back in open session, Mr President.
- 15 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:05:12](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 16 Mr Courtroom Officer.
- 17 Ms Taylor.
- 18 MS TAYLOR: [15:05:17] Thank you.
- 19 Q. [15:05:18] We're going to play it with sound for the interpreters. The transcript
- 20 is Defence tab 46, it's MLI-D28-0005-5000. And if they could kindly give me
- 21 a thumbs up when they're ready, we'll then play it.
- 22 Thank you. We'll play it now from evidence 2 with sound.
- 23 (Viewing of the video excerpt)
- 24 THE INTERPRETER: [15:06:01] (Interpretation of video excerpt) "No to war, no to
- 25 foreign meddling, yes to negotiations [...] Inaudible.

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 Killing people by famine and then shelling them is something that goes against the
- 2 law of God, the United Nations charter and is contrary to humanity.
- 3 Preserve the archeology of Timbuktu, and preserve its innocent population. Spare it
- 4 from blind bombings.
- 5 To the north of the fragile towns and old buildings, and they do not -- or cannot put
- 6 up with these shellings because it's the extermination of their people.
- 7 The people...the people.
- 8 May peace be with you, may peace be with you, may peace be with you."
- 9 End of sight translation.
- 10 (Viewing of the video excerpt)
- 11 MS TAYLOR: [15:07:41] I might have given the wrong reference to the English
- 12 transcript, but I believe we can correct that afterwards, as the French would have been
- 13 correct.
- Q. [15:07:59] Mr Witness, does this refresh your memory as to when this occurred?
- We're in open session.
- 16 A. [15:08:10] Yes. As I said, it was a march that happened at the same time as the
- 17 French shelling, but also at the same time as the members of the Dawa community ...
- 18 So I remember only too well this march.
- 19 MS TAYLOR: [15:08:52] I believe the correct reference I should have given would
- 20 have been tab 48, MLI-D28-0005-7114, for the English. So I apologise to the
- 21 interpreters for that.
- 22 Q. [15:09:10] Now, Mr Witness, after the Malian army came into Timbuktu, did
- 23 many of the Arab and Tuareg population flee from Timbuktu?
- 24 A. [15:09:27] Yes, at the beginning of the reconquest, many people fled as they were
- 25 fearful of reprisals. And many people left the city, but some also remained as they

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 were convinced that they should.
- 2 Q. [15:10:14] Mr Witness, you've said that, "they were fearful of reprisals."
- 3 Were there reprisals based on what you know or heard?
- 4 A. [15:10:24] I didn't personally hear of any cases of reprisals. However, there
- 5 were mistakes that were highlighted by some media, and, just after the reconquest, I
- 6 came to rest for a while in Bamako. So after the reconquest, I rested up for a few
- 7 months.
- 8 And amongst those mistakes that were talked about in the media, there was the
- 9 disappearance of an Arab tradesmen, Ali Kobbad in addition to two other salesmen
- 10 who sold salt, and I saw something about the director of Nour El-Moubin and
- 11 various foreign media made documentaries in which I read about or saw material
- 12 about the mistakes made by the Malian army, but I was not out in the field myself at
- 13 the time.
- 14 Q. [15:12:26] Mr Witness, you've referred to the director of Nour El-Moubin. Are
- 15 you referring to an individual called Mohamed Lamine?
- 16 A. [15:12:40] Yes, precisely.
- 17 Q. [15:12:47] You referred to foreign media and documentaries. Are you familiar
- 18 with articles written by Rukmini Callimachi and Baba Ahmed concerning what
- 19 happened to these individuals?
- 20 A. [15:13:08] I didn't read what Baba Ahmed wrote. But as I said to you, it was on
- 21 Western media like France 24, TV5, they made documentaries about these mistakes
- 22 made by the Malian army.
- 23 MS TAYLOR: [15:13:38] Mr President, I will need to play one small video in private
- session, and then I believe we can be in open session based on what the witness has

25 said.

Trial Hearing MLI-OTP-P-0654 (Private Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:13:53](Interpretation) Mr Courtroom Officer.
- 2 (Private session at 3.14 p.m.)
- 3 THE COURT OFFICER: [15:14:04] We're in private session, Mr President.
- 4 (Redacted)
- 5 (Redacted)
- 6 (Redacted)
- 7 (Redacted)
- 8 (Redacted)
- 9 (Redacted)
- 10 (Redacted)
- 11 (Redacted)
- 12 (Redacted)
- 13 (Redacted)
- 14 (Redacted)
- 15 (Redacted)
- 16 (Redacted)
- 17 (Redacted)
- 18 (Redacted)
- 19 (Redacted)
- 20 (Redacted)
- 21 (Redacted)
- 22 (Redacted)
- 23 (Redacted)
- 24 (Redacted)
- 25 (Redacted)

ICC-01/12-01/18

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

MLI-OTP-P-0654

ICC-01/12-01/18

(Private Session)

Trial Hearing

MLI-OTP-P-0654

Trial Hearing MLI-OTP-P-0654

(Private Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 (Redacted)
- 2 (Redacted)
- 3 (Redacted)
- 4 (Redacted)
- 5 (Redacted)
- 6 (Redacted)
- 7 (Redacted)
- 8 (Redacted)
- 9 (Open session at 3.23 p.m.)
- 10 THE COURT OFFICER: [15:23:43] We are back in open session, Mr President.
- 11 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:23:53](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 12 Mr Courtroom Officer.
- 13 Ms Taylor.
- 14 MS TAYLOR: [15:24:02] Thank you, Mr President.
- 15 Q. [15:24:04] Now, Mr Witness, we're in open session.
- 16 You referred earlier to media documentaries by -- I think it was France 24. I'm going
- to play some -- a short extract. It's Defence tab 92. It's MLI-OTP-0068-4828. I'll be
- playing a short extract without sound. It's between 4:26 to 4:40. And we're playing
- 19 it on evidence 2.
- 20 (Viewing of the video excerpt)
- 21 MS TAYLOR: [15:25:00] We'll be stopping at 4:40.
- 22 Q. [15:25:08] Mr Witness, do you recognise the individual shown?
- 23 A. [15:25:11] Yes. It is Ali Kobbad, the elderly gentleman.
- Q. [15:25:17] I'm just going to play another section from 8:26 until 11:19. And if
- 25 we could play it with sound. The transcript is tab 93. It's MLI-OTP-0078-6219.

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 The translation is tab 94, MLI-OTP-0078-6227.
- 2 If the interpreters could kindly indicate to me if they're ready.
- 3 THE COURT OFFICER: [15:25:54] Sorry. Would counsel kindly confirm what
- 4 page and the level of confidentiality as well. Thank you.
- 5 MS TAYLOR: [15:26:00] I believe this can be played in open session. And I'll just
- 6 find the page for the interpreters. I think it should be on page 6224 from lines 169.
- 7 (Counsel confer)
- 8 MS TAYLOR: [15:27:05] And the translation would be page 6223 from -- from line
- 9 175.
- 10 THE INTERPRETER: [15:27:32] The interpreter is having problems finding the
- document because there's a contradiction between the lines and the actual number of
- 12 the document. Sorry.
- 13 Could you please repeat the number of the tab.
- 14 MS TAYLOR: [15:27:49] Certainly. The translation is tab 94. The full document is
- 15 MLI-OTP-0078-6227.
- 16 THE INTERPRETER: [15:28:04] Thank you. Which line would you like us to start
- 17 with?
- 18 MS TAYLOR: [15:28:10] Line 175.
- 19 THE INTERPRETER: [15:28:25] This is a different document to the one actually up
- 20 on the screen on evidence 2, 175.
- 21 Do you mean commencing with: "Soudain, derrière le groupe ..."
- 22 Is that the one you are identifying?
- 23 MS TAYLOR: [15:28:47] Yes, I believe so.
- 24 THE INTERPRETER: [15:28:49] All right. Thank you.
- 25 MS TAYLOR: [15:28:50] Also, if it would be quicker, we can also insert the text into

ICC-01/12-01/18

- the transcript afterwards, if that would assist the interpreters, so as not to lose time
- 2 because I believe it's in French.
- 3 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:29:05](Interpretation) Yes. Indeed, Ms Taylor,
- 4 in order to save time.
- 5 (Viewing of the video excerpt)
- 6 (Translation of video excerpt MLI-OTP-0078-6227, commencing from line 175)
- 7 Reporter (voice over): Suddenly, behind the group, Ali the Arab cattle farmer
- 8 appeared with his friend Moustapha. The old man has come to offer the army a cow
- 9 for having freed the city.
- 10 Reporter (voice over): This doesn't mean to say that he is welcome.
- "Those whites there! Take them to the exit. We don't want them here!"
- "And take your bull back!"
- 13 Non-Identified Speaker: "Those whites, those whites (incomprehensible), will leave,
- 14 we don't want them. Take your bull back."
- 15 Reporter: Surprised, yet compliant, they leave the camp. This was the last time we
- saw the old man. The cow was not lost to all. A few minutes later, the soldiers
- 17 discreetly usher it into their barracks.
- 18 "It's so sad! I am heartbroken. Ali is a man of peace and we want peace. Only
- 19 peace."
- 20 Reporter: The next day, in front of the old man's house, people are grief-stricken.
- 21 People from the neighbourhood have formed a crowd in front of his door to rally
- around the son and a neighbour who are in shock.
- 23 Reporter: One of the inhabitants of the neighbourhood saw it all. She is the only
- one who agrees to testify. The other neighbours are afraid of reprisals.
- 25 Non-Identified Speaker: A military vehicle stopped here. They went straight to his

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 house. They didn't even question him, he wasn't given the time to express himself.
- 2 He was so afraid that he couldn't get into...he was pushed into the vehicle. That's
- 3 how he was taken away. He never collaborated with the terrorists. If the terrorists
- 4 came, he would also say that he wanted peace. Really, if we can really motivate the
- 5 population, we need to march to put a stop to this confusion.
- 6 Reporter: At the site, we also learn that the tradesmen selling salt were also arrested
- 7 in the process. We find young Boukar in a state of shock.
- 8 Boukar: They got them and took them away...they covered them with a tarpaulin...
- 9 The Malian army took them...for no reason... They said nothing to them; they just
- 10 took them away.
- 11 Boukar: The army came and took my father away. They put a tarpaulin over him.
- 12 The Malian army. They did not utter a word, they just took him without any
- 13 reason. They wanted to take me too, in their truck. But then they said "stay,
- 14 stay".
- 15 Reporter: Worried about being seen, Boukar joins his grandfather who has come to
- take care of him in the family home.
- 17 Boukar's grandfather: My two sons were born here. Both of them. In Timbuktu.
- 18 We have never left here! Somebody who had committed a crime would not have
- 19 stayed here.
- 20 Reporter: For the Touaregs and Arabs of the city, the new free Timbuktu has
- 21 become a trap.
- 22 End of translation.
- 23 MS TAYLOR:
- Q. [15:32:16] Mr Witness, in the first part of this extract, we saw an old man with
- 25 a cow. Was that Ali Ould Kobbad?

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 A. [15:32:28] Kobbad, yes, him.
- 2 Q. [15:32:31] And at the end, we saw a reference to a -- someone who sold salt. Is
- 3 that the same person you were referring to earlier?
- 4 A. [15:32:42] Exactly.
- 5 Q. [15:32:48] In this extract, we heard people describing what they saw and heard.
- 6 Is this consistent with what you yourself heard from people at the time?
- 7 A. [15:33:03] Exactly. It's the same version that I heard. And having approached
- 8 the old person, he told me he was never associated with this type of thing. His
- 9 conviction was to stay at home.
- 10 Q. [15:33:47] (Overlapping speakers) And did you hear or receive any information
- that the bodies of Ali Ould Kobbad and Mohamed Lamine were found in the dunes?
- 12 A. [15:34:03] There, too, I followed the media, but not for Ali Kobbad.
- 13 They -- they've buried the body in his shop, and they said that it was Mohamed
- 14 Lamine.
- 15 Q. [15:34:28] Now, Mr Witness, earlier you talked about the reasons why you
- stayed in Timbuktu and one of those reasons -- you gave several reasons, and one of
- 17 them concerned your family situation.
- 18 Based on your discussions with individuals, was this also a factor for Tuaregs who
- 19 were present in Timbuktu?
- 20 A. [15:34:54] Yes, what I said. A lot of them had several different reasons. They
- 21 were Tuaregs, Arabs, who stayed because of the same conviction. Some of them just
- 22 didn't have the means; so they couldn't even get to the refugee camps so then they fell
- 23 into a trap and they had to stay.
- Even if these people stayed, they were still afraid.
- Q. [15:35:51] And for the ones that had to stay, based on what you saw or heard,

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 was pressure placed on them by their community to join the groups?
- 2 A. [15:36:03] I'm sorry, I haven't understood the question. If there was pressure
- 3 from whom?
- 4 Q. [15:36:22] Mr Witness, I apologise, I'll make it more specific.
- 5 At transcript 131, page 23, lines 23 to 24, you stated:
- 6 "[...] there was pressure on people to be active."
- 7 And at page 31, line 7 to 11, the Prosecution refreshed your memory with the
- 8 following. This is line 7 to 11:
- 9 "But one time, even though I had not even asked him the question, Lahssane said to
- me, 'Elder brother, I'm in this thing because I have to be.'
- 11 [Speaks English] And then the next sentence:
- 12 [Interpretation] He explained to me that since he was from the Tuareg community, he
- was obliged to be with them."
- 14 Based on your conversation with Al Hassan, was it your understanding that he'd
- been pressured by his community to be part of this group in 2012?
- 16 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:37:30](Interpretation) Madam Prosecutor.
- 17 MS LUPING: [15:37:33] Mr President, if we could cut the sound to the witness.
- 18 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:37:40](Interpretation) Court officer, please cut
- 19 the sound to the witness.
- 20 THE COURT OFFICER: [15:37:46] Your Honours, the sound at the VTC location has
- 21 been cut off.
- 22 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:37:53](Interpretation) Thank you very much.
- 23 Madam Prosecutor.
- 24 MS LUPING: [15:37:56] Mr President, I object to the question, because it calls for the
- 25 witness to speculate about the relationship that the accused had with his community

Trial Hearing MLI-OTP-P-0654

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- and the reasons for which he actually assumed the role that he did. It's not
- 2 appropriate for this witness to be able to state.
- 3 He's able to say what the conversation was about. But for him to confirm whether or
- 4 not Mr Al Hassan was pressured by his community to be part of group, in our
- 5 submission, goes too far. It's calling for this witness to speculate. He is not in
- 6 a position to give that information.
- 7 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:38:42](Interpretation) Madam Prosecutor, I'm
- 8 trying to check the transcript.
- 9 Page 78, lines 23 to 25. I think that Ms Taylor asked the witness if according to the
- 10 conversations that he had with Mr Al Hassan. So that's not speculation.
- 11 Ms Taylor, please proceed.
- 12 MS TAYLOR: [15:39:13] Thank you, Mr President.
- 13 If we could have the sound re-established with the witness.
- 14 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:39:21](Interpretation) Yes.
- 15 Court officer, please, could we have the sound.
- 16 THE COURT OFFICER: [15:39:27] The sound at the VTC location has been
- 17 re-established.
- 18 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:39:32](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 19 court officer.
- 20 Ms Taylor.
- 21 MS TAYLOR:
- 22 Q. [15:39:36] Mr Witness, do you recall the question, or would you like me to
- 23 repeat it?
- 24 A. [15:39:41] If you could repeat the question, please.
- 25 Q. [15:39:51] My question was, based on your conversations with Al Hassan, did

Trial Hearing MLI-OTP-P-0654

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 you understand from these conversations or did you receive information from these
- 2 conversations that he had been pressured by his community, the Tuareg community,
- 3 to be part of the group in Timbuktu in 2012?
- 4 A. [15:40:13] It's possible, but it's not in the same case. When I talked about
- 5 pressure, I said those that stayed, they couldn't be victim to pressure from their
- 6 community. Perhaps they would get advice that they had to move until -- until the
- 7 town was stable. That's advice that they could get.
- 8 Now, where it concerns Al Hassan, when the group was started -- when you set up
- 9 a group, there are certain conditions that need to be met. You need human resources.
- 10 You have to have the financial means, logistics. All of that.
- 11 So those who had the means to contribute with human, financial, and logistical
- 12 resources did so. Those who had nothing to give, could give their children. Those
- 13 who had children but didn't want to give them, they could make a financial
- 14 contribution. That was at the start of the group, when the group was being set up.
- 15 It wasn't just atypical of the Tuareg. It was in a lot of groups -- a lot of groups start
- out in that way. It's not only typical of the Tuareg.
- 17 The fact that Al Hassan told me that there was a constraint, that is explained; so I
- don't need to -- didn't need to go into the details to ask him what his contribution was.
- 19 The fact -- whether he was an activist, I didn't go into that type of detail.
- 20 Q. [15:42:28] Now, Mr Witness, I'm going to refer to your work with
- 21 going -- without going into details.
- 22 Is it correct that Mr Al Hassan never tried to pressure you as concerns your work?
- 23 A. [15:42:43] Personally, me? No. I'll come back to that.
- 24 Quite the opposite. He facilitated my work.
- 25 Q. [15:43:03] And when you saw Mr Al Hassan, is it correct that he didn't have

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 a weapon on him?
- 2 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:43:16](Interpretation) Madam Prosecutor.
- 3 MS LUPING: [15:43:18] Mr President, could I ask that the sound be cut off to the
- 4 witness.
- 5 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:43:25](Interpretation) Court officer, please could
- 6 you be so kind as to cut the sound to the witness.
- 7 THE COURT OFFICER: [15:43:32](Overlapping speakers) Your Honours, the sound
- 8 at the VTC location has been cut off.
- 9 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:43:35](Interpretation) Thank you very much.
- 10 Madam Prosecutor.
- 11 MS LUPING: [15:43:37] Mr President, your Honours, the objection is to the
- 12 extremely general nature of this question. There is absolutely no indication of what
- 13 time period or specific event that we're talking about. And if it is identifying, I
- 14 would then ask that we move into private session.
- But at this stage, it's simply an extremely general question as to "when you saw
- 16 Mr Al Hassan."
- 17 He -- this witness has testified about seeing the accused on different occasions. So
- it's extremely unclear as to what the question relates to.
- 19 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:44:14](Interpretation) Ms Taylor, I agree with
- 20 Madam Prosecutor. This is a vague question. Please, can you try to reformulate it.
- 21 MS TAYLOR: [15:44:23] Thank you, Mr President. Although I do believe we can
- do it in open session and I believe ...
- 23 If the sound could be re-established with the witness.
- 24 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:44:36](Interpretation) Court officer, please
- 25 re-establish the connection.

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 THE COURT OFFICER: [15:44:41] Your Honours, the sound at the VTC location has
- 2 been re-established.
- 3 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:44:48](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 4 court officer.
- 5 Ms Taylor.
- 6 MS TAYLOR:
- 7 Q. [15:44:53] Mr Witness, it's correct, isn't it, that you saw Mr Al Hassan on several
- 8 occasions between May 2012 and the end of January or mid-January 2013?
- 9 MS TAYLOR: [15:45:06] I don't know why I'm getting an objection here. I'm
- 10 establishing a foundation.
- 11 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:45:15](Interpretation) Madam Prosecutor.
- 12 MS LUPING: [15:45:16] Mr President, I'm going to have to ask that the sound be cut
- off to the witness for this next objection, which is a new and a different objection.
- 14 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:45:29](Interpretation) Court officer, please cut
- 15 the sound.
- 16 THE COURT OFFICER: [15:45:35] Your Honours, the sound has been cut off.
- 17 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:45:40](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 18 Court Officer.
- 19 Madam Prosecutor.
- 20 MS LUPING: [15:45:43] Mr President, your Honours, my objection relates to the
- 21 time period that has been stipulated to the witness that he saw Mr Al Hassan in
- 22 different occasions between May 2012 and the end of January.
- 23 At no point has the witness stated that the first time he saw Mr Al Hassan that it was
- 24 only from May 2012. Quite the contrary. This witness has stated that the Islamic
- 25 police was already established by the end of April 2012, and when he gave evidence

Trial Hearing MLI-OTP-P-0654 (Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- as to when he first saw Mr Al Hassan, he said it was at the beginning although, he
- 2 did not know what his role was at that time and he saw him at the BMS of the
- 3 Islamic police.
- 4 So it is incorrect to assert as a fact that the witness saw Mr Al Hassan from May 2012.
- 5 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:46:48](Interpretation) Ms Taylor.
- 6 MS TAYLOR: [15:46:51] Mr President, I wasn't asserting any facts as to when the
- 7 witness first -- first saw Mr Al Hassan. And as this Chamber and the Prosecution are
- 8 aware, I am giving the time period of the charges.
- 9 Now, I'm wasting a lot of time on meaningless objections.
- 10 Now, throughout the entirety of the Prosecution's examination-in-chief between -- for
- various witnesses they will phrase questions between a certain date and another date,
- 12 blah, blah, blah.
- Now, this witness has been talking about 2012. It's abundantly clear the time period
- 14 we're referring to. They've asked me to give more specificity, I'm trying to do that,
- 15 except that I keep constantly getting objections and interruptions.
- Now, I don't believe it's necessary to go through every single incident --
- 17 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:47:39](Interpretation) Very well. Very well,
- 18 Ms Taylor.
- 19 Madam Prosecutor, I think that Ms Taylor is right. Because the first question was
- 20 vague, and I said it was vague. Then Ms Taylor has reframed and reformulated the
- 21 question within a certain time frame. Now this time frame is that of the charges
- 22 precisely.
- 23 So now let her put her question -- no, no. Please sit down.
- 24 Ms Taylor, please go ahead.
- 25 MS TAYLOR: [15:48:15] Thank you very much. And if we could have the sound

Trial Hearing MLI-OTP-P-0654

(Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 established with the witness.
- 2 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:48:22](Interpretation) Court Officer.
- 3 THE COURT OFFICER: [15:48:26] Your Honours, the sound has been re-established.
- 4 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:48:31](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 5 Court Officer.
- 6 Ms Taylor.
- 7 MS TAYLOR: [15:48:35]
- 8 Q. [15:48:35] Now, Mr Witness, I apologise for these interruptions.
- 9 Now, speaking of a certain time period, we're talking in the time period of the
- 10 charges that's the beginning of May until mid- or end of January 2013 on the times
- that you saw Mr Al Hassan, based on your knowledge is it correct that he did not
- 12 have a weapon? He was not wearing a weapon?
- 13 A. [15:49:04] I didn't say that he wasn't armed. What I said was every time I saw
- 14 him, it was in his office. But I would not say that people didn't see him with
- 15 a weapon. I said every time I went to see him, it was in his office. He was there.
- 16 He was present. That was it.
- 17 Q. [15:49:48] Mr Witness, speaking specifically of what you saw when you saw him,
- did you see him on these occasions with a weapon on him?
- 19 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:50:06](Interpretation) Madam Prosecutor.
- 20 MS LUPING: [15:50:07] Objection, Mr President. Asked and answered. The
- 21 question was asked and a clear answer has been given.
- 22 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:50:18](Interpretation) Ms Taylor.
- 23 MS TAYLOR: [15:50:23] I don't believe the witness has himself seen what he
- saw -- he said he can't see what -- he can't say, one way or the other, what other
- 25 people saw. He's just said he was at -- when he saw him he was at his bureau.

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 So I'm a clarification on the basis of that. I do believe we should be entitled to do so.
- 2 The Prosecution has asked numerous clarification questions. And I do believe that
- 3 he's only referred thus far -- he hasn't made any positive assertion.
- 4 He has said:
- 5 "I can't say that other persons didn't see him armed. But me, I say that when I saw
- 6 him, it was at his office. He was present."
- 7 He hasn't said what he himself saw.
- 8 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:51:13](Interpretation) Madam Prosecutor, when
- 9 Ms Taylor was speaking, I was checking the transcript. What Ms Taylor says is true.
- 10 That's what we've got on the transcript.
- 11 So perhaps you have to give the witness to -- opportunity to answer one last time, just
- 12 to save some time here.
- 13 Witness, could you please answer the question of Ms Taylor one last time.
- 14 THE WITNESS: [15:51:48](Interpretation) I don't remember seeing him with
- 15 a weapon when I spoke to him.
- 16 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [15:51:55](Interpretation) Very well.
- 17 Let's make progress on this, Ms Taylor.
- 18 MS TAYLOR: [15:52:00] Thank you, Mr President.
- 19 Q. [15:52:02] I'm now moving on to another subject, and that's concerning the
- 20 events at the beginning of 2012.
- 21 And at transcript 2 -- 127, that's page 47, the Prosecution asked you questions
- 22 concerning what happened in Kidal and Gao. And at lines 3 to 4, you said:
- 23 "The army wanted to keep a hold over Kidal, but at the end of March Kidal came
- 24 under attack. And then it was Gao's turn, which did not resist either."
- 25 Is it correct that you learned about what happened in Kidal and Gao at this time

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 through the media, specifically through RFI?
- 2 A. [15:52:52] Yes. I had other ways of checking this information as well.
- 3 Q. [15:53:12] Now, Mr Witness, I'm going to refer to your statement, it's the first
- 4 statement you gave to the Prosecutor. And it's MLI-OTP-0019-0296 at 0304,
- 5 paragraph 50:
- 6 (Interpretation) "Friday March 2012, Kidal fell in the hands of the armed groups.
- 7 Then, Gao fell. That was 31 March. I learned of these attacks thanks to the media."
- 8 (No interpretation)
- 9 THE COURT OFFICER: [15:54:09] Counsel, I'm sorry to interrupt. Is it R01 or R02?
- 10 MS TAYLOR: [15:54:15] I apologise. R02.
- 11 I will just repeat the last bit:
- 12 (Interpretation) "On the Friday 30 March 2012, Kidal fell into the hands of the armed
- 13 group. Then, Gao fell. It was 31 March. I learnt about the attacks thanks to the
- 14 media. Everybody was stuck to listening to the news of RFI."
- 15 (Speaks English) Mr Witness, do you recall saying this to the Prosecutor?
- 16 A. [15:55:02] (Overlapping speakers) Yes.
- 17 Q. [15:55:05] Mr Witness, do you recall saying this to the Prosecutor?
- 18 A. [15:55:11] Yes.
- 19 Q. [15:55:16] Is it correct that the media was your source of information?
- 20 A. [15:55:21] Mm-hmm.
- 21 THE INTERPRETER: [15:55:25] Says the witness.
- 22 MS TAYLOR: [15:55:28]
- Q. [15:55:30] Now, in the lead-up to 2012, is it correct that the Malian state failed to
- 24 take steps to eliminate the Al Qaeda presence in the north of Mali? Speaking of 2011.
- 25 A. [15:55:50] I wouldn't say the state failed to do that. There was a tomb that was

ICC-01/12-01/18

- destroyed from the Malian -- of an officer of the Malian army. He had fought, and,
- 2 he too, he was a victim of a reprisal, a retaliation.
- 3 I cannot say that the Malian army didn't fight against Al Qaeda, but perhaps the
- 4 presence of this group was minimised in that part of the territory.
- 5 Q. [15:56:52] Now, speaking of the beginning of 2012, did the Malian government
- 6 provide support to the Arab militia, the Berabiche militia in Timbuktu? I'm talking
- 7 here about the very first months.
- 8 A. [15:57:10] Yes, the setting up of the militia was something that the government
- 9 wanted. If you have a republican army, you can't have such forces in a serious
- 10 country. It was denounced by the population, firstly, not only because of the setting
- up of the militia, but in particular it was an ethnic militia.
- 12 Q. [15:57:54] And as an ethnic militia, was -- were there concerns that it would not
- 13 act to protect all ethnicities?
- 14 A. [15:58:05] That's exactly the point.
- 15 Q. [15:58:21] Now turning to the events of 1 April 2012, is it correct that the Arab
- militia were able to take over public buildings after the Malian army abandoned
- 17 them?
- 18 A. [15:58:37] Public buildings weren't guarded by the Malian army. The social
- 19 services were run by civil servants and administrators and officials. The soldiers
- 20 were in the garrison, which was occupied by the Malian army. The MNLA was
- occupying the garrison, but prior to the arrival of the MNLA, indeed, it was the
- 22 militia who preceded the MNLA.
- Q. [15:59:35] Now, according to a Prosecution witness it's P-65, it's transcript 45,
- 24 page 11, lines 2 to 7 I'll just read out the relevant sections and ask you a question.
- 25 "Do you recall telling the Prosecution in 2014, that at this point the Arab militia

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 played a double game; that they were initially part of the Malian army, but after the
- 2 Malian army left Timbuktu, they pretended to chase them out to create an appearance
- 3 that they were opposed to the army?"
- 4 Answer: "Very much so."
- 5 Mr Witness, were you in a position to ascertain whether there was any actual
- 6 confrontation between the Malian army and the Arab militia?
- 7 A. [16:00:23] I'm sorry, what year was that?
- 8 Q. [16:00:32] I apologise, Mr Witness. We are speaking about the beginning of
- 9 April 2012, and I read to you a quote where a previous witness was speaking about
- 10 a double game being played, that is:
- "[...] after the Malian army left Timbuktu, they pretended to chase them out to create
- 12 an appearance that they were opposed to the army?"
- 13 A. [16:01:01] I don't remember a convoy being seen -- a convoy leaving. What I
- 14 know is that on the 31st, the last convoy of the Malian army leaving Niafunké for
- 15 Timbuktu -- left Niafunké for Timbuktu, but they weren't given the time for this
- 16 convoy to transit to Timbuktu. It continued directly onwards.
- 17 And, on the morning -- that's when the first shots were heard, the commander in the
- 18 zone was in the camp. He was with his two wives. He refused to abandon the
- 19 camp. And (Redacted) and
- 20 make no resistance, which would go against the population. The argument, which
- 21 was put forward -- which the officer put forward is that he had received no
- 22 decision -- no order from Bamako to abandon the camp. Even if the others had left,
- 23 he would die there.
- 24 And it was afterwards, that (Redacted)
- 25 (Redacted). And this officer of the

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 Malian army, he was on an armoured vehicle going towards the town, a heavily
- 2 armed vehicle -- armoured vehicle.
- 3 And now, it wasn't possible to get hold of anyone at the time. There were orders
- 4 from Bamako. And the army had no structure left. They didn't know who was in
- 5 charge of whom. And that was on the first day of the coup, and you can imagine the
- 6 first hours.
- 7 So (Redacted)
- 8 (Redacted). And he made his colleague
- 9 from Timbuktu understand that he was not going to receive any order because,
- 10 "There was no leader. Nobody in command. It was total disorder, so it was in your
- interest in saving the population of Timbuktu, when you are not in a position of
- strength, then go and free up the space ... whatever happens."
- 13 That was the argument which was used to convince this person to leave the camp.
- 14 And indeed, he was still supported by another community to get him to leave, an
- 15 Arab that I knew perfectly well who helped to take him out of harm and to protect
- 16 him so that he would be alone outside Timbuktu.
- 17 And that's how I knew there wasn't any confrontation and, even less, any tricks
- played as to the best of my knowledge. That's the first thing that I wanted to say.
- 19 And when the MNLA came in at 11 o'clock to Timbuktu, there was no resistance to
- 20 make it seem or not seem to accompany the MNLA. They came in majestically to
- 21 establish themselves -- set themselves up in the military camp.
- 22 Q. [16:06:13] Thank you, Mr Witness.
- 23 MS TAYLOR: [16:06:17] And I do believe it's six past four. I apologise to the Bench,
- but I didn't want to disturb the witness as he was giving a response.
- 25 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [16:06:33](Interpretation) Yes, you are right,

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 Ms Taylor. It is six minutes past four, we didn't want to interrupt the witness.
- 2 Mr Witness.
- 3 THE WITNESS: [16:06:43](Interpretation) Mr President.
- 4 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [16:06:46](Interpretation) We have come to the end
- 5 of your testimony for today and we shall now rise in a few moments. As you will
- 6 have noticed, your testimony is not yet over. But tomorrow, here, at the Court, it is
- 7 an official holiday, so we shall not be sitting. We shall, therefore, meet again on
- 8 Friday morning at 9.30 a.m. as usual. On behalf of the Chamber I would like to
- 9 thank you for your patience, for your clear answers and precise answers, and I would
- 10 like to also remind you that you are not allowed to talk to anybody about your
- 11 testimony.
- 12 Ms Taylor, before we rise for today, I would just like to ask you how much time you
- 13 need because you can see with this official holiday and with the witness, I just need to
- 14 have a little idea.
- 15 MS TAYLOR: [16:08:00] Thank you, Mr President. It's a bit hard to give an answer
- off the hoof like that. I wasn't expecting not to sit yesterday, so that has in a way
- 17 impacted upon us.
- 18 We would definitely need to obviously continue over to Monday, and I would need
- 19 to liaise with the Registry to see how much time I have used, but I do have
- 20 some -- quite a few substantive topics to address with the witness.
- 21 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [16:08:36](Interpretation) You shall be continuing on
- 22 Monday, therefore, but do you think that you will be able to wrap up on Monday
- 23 before lunch or in the afternoon?
- 24 MS TAYLOR: [16:08:46] It's very difficult to answer that, Mr President, because
- obviously our time is impacted upon by whether we have objections et cetera, so that

ICC-01/12-01/18

- does affect the ability for me to plan my cross-examination.
- 2 Perhaps if it would be permissible to the Chamber, if I can give a response at the
- 3 beginning of Friday? But I would believe it would be conservative to at least allow
- 4 for perhaps some time on Tuesday, but I will obviously do my best to have a more
- 5 streamlined cross-examination.
- 6 But I do believe it's premature for me to give you an exact answer at this point.
- 7 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [16:09:30](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 8 Ms Taylor. So we shall wait for Friday to find out your answer or to hear your
- 9 answer.
- 10 Mr Courtroom Officer, are you saying that there remains a certain amount of time?
- 11 Could you please do the accounting. Where are we at?
- 12 THE COURT OFFICER: [16:09:58] The Defence has used four hours and 41 minutes
- 13 so far.
- 14 PRESIDING JUDGE MINDUA: [16:10:07](Interpretation) Thank you very much,
- 15 Mr Courtroom Officer.
- 16 So, we shall await your answer on Friday, Ms Taylor. But I might have liked it to
- 17 come to an end on Monday.
- 18 So Madam Prosecutor, you heard what Ms Taylor said. If there are lots of objections
- 19 being raised, she can't move forward. So would you like to answer that? No.
- 20 So before rising for today, I would like to, as always, very sincerely thank all of those
- 21 who make this hearing possible. I'm of course thinking of the parties because they
- 22 are the lynchpin -- the parties and participants. We have our court reporters, our
- 23 interpreters, our security guards and, of course, our public who are always our
- 24 greatest supporters.
- 25 I wish you all a very pleasant evening.

Trial Hearing MLI-OTP-P-0654 (Open Session)

ICC-01/12-01/18

- 1 And I say, until Friday morning, Court is adjourned.
- 2 THE COURT USHER: [16:11:22] All rise.
- 3 (The hearing ends in open session at 4.11 p.m.)